

**CITY OF MADERA PLANNING COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
February 11, 2020**

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Gran at 6:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioner Robert Gran, Jr. (Chairperson)
Commissioner Israel Cortes (Vice Chairperson)
Commissioner Richard Broadhead
Commissioner Pamela Tyler
Commissioner Alex Salazar
Commissioner Ramon Lopez-Maciel

ABSENT: Commissioner Ryan Cerioni

STAFF: Darrell Unruh, Interim Planning Manager
Jesus Orozco, Assistant Planner
Keith Helmuth, City Engineer
Tiffany Ljuba, Assistant Engineer
Brandi Garcia, Recording Secretary

PLEDGE: Chairperson Gran led the Pledge of Allegiance.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None

MINUTES: None

NON-PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:

1. Election of Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson for 2020

Commissioner Gran noted its tradition that the Vice-Chair from last year becomes Chair and he nominated Israel Cortes for Chairperson. Commissioner Tyler seconded the motion.

Commissioner Salazar nominated Bobby Gran as Vice-Chair and Commissioner Broadhead seconded the motion.

The motions nominations carried unanimously.

CONSENT ITEMS: None

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:

Brandi Garcia, Recording Secretary announced that documents for Public Hearing Item #1 were distributed to the Commission after the packet was finalized and that copies were available in the back of the room.

1. PPL 2019-06 & VAR 2019-05 – Eagle Meadows Apartments

A continued noticed public hearing to consider a precise plan to allow for the development of a 106-unit multifamily residential complex on 3.67 acres located in proximity to the southwest corner of the intersection of Ellis and Merced Streets in the PD-1500 (Planned Development) Zone District with an HD (High Density) General Plan land use designation (Multiple APNs). A Negative Declaration will also be considered by the Planning Commission.

This item was presented by Darrell Unruh, Interim Planning Manager. He noted the changes from the last meeting when the item was continued to allow modifications.

Commissioner Gran asked Mr. Unruh to tell them where the carports are going to go.

Mr. Unruh said the majority of them circle the open space area and there's another one by the recreation area.

Commissioner Gran confirmed that you will only see them once inside.

Mr. Unruh said they are not that visible from the street because they are circled by the complex and on the interior of the site.

Commissioner Gran said that overall were trying to reduce the carbon footprint.

Mr. Unruh said that's correct, they're responding to California Energy Commission and State Building Code requirements.

Shannon Chaffin, Legal Counsel said that there are actually new state law requirements that require cities to accommodate reasonable uses of solar panels. In order to do that, one way would be a flatter roof to increase electricity generation.

Mr. Unruh said he didn't remember Shannon being introduced. Shannon Chaffin is representing the City Attorney tonight. He has quite a few years of experience and we are happy to have him here.

Commissioner Broadhead confirmed the parking structures that would have the solar panels are the ones circling the middle section.

Mr. Unruh said he believes there are some adjacent to the auxiliary parking area as well. He also showed a slide that showed the flat roof structures that will need to be used to accommodate the panels.

Commissioner Cortes said he thought he remembered from the last meeting some talk about requiring a second point of access from the East side of the project.

Mr. Unruh said that's correct, there was some concern noted regarding public safety and possibly for the convenience of the future residents to have more than one access. Staff considered the concern and reviewed it with the Fire Marshal. He was satisfied with the access on the West. There will be a pedestrian gate that will allow occupants to enter and exit to the street.

Commissioner Broadhead noted there was already a pedestrian access at the bottom of the slide. He asked if a pedestrian access onto Ellis St. was considered.

Mr. Unruh replied that there is one on the North side.

Commissioner Cortes opened the public hearing and invited the applicant to step forward.

Ubaldo Garcia of 156 Asilomar Dr. in Madera stepped to the podium. He thanked the Commissioners for allowing him to revise the project and said they have worked on the concerns that were presented.

Regarding the fire access, the Fire Marshal said it would cause more headaches than it would solve problems. With a crash gate, there's always a risk of running someone on the other side over. He said it was easier to just maintain the access on the opposite subdivision. They provided a pedestrian access on Merced St. and Ellis St. There will be a continuous path of travel within the project even if the neighbor on the corner doesn't want to cooperate and provide sidewalk. They are currently showing a locked gate, but the apartment complex is not gated. Anybody could walk through the vehicular access if they wanted to.

Another thing was the parking. They have used in the past multi-use parking field. They pave the surface with a smooth concrete that you could park on and play any kind of sport without injuring yourself.

The third concern was the carports. Per California, they are now required to be net zero. The best angle to catch the sun at this latitude is 6 and 12. A 45-degree roof pitch is the perfect pitch but that would be too noticeable. Flat roofs don't really catch anything, your efficiency drops by ½. At the end of the day all they really need is a roof that faces South as close to 45-degrees as they could get. A pitch they will propose will be 4 and 12. They could still make it look good but not like their normal carports.

Commissioner Gran asked Mr. Garcia to show them the location of the carports.

Mr. Garcia said all the way around the open space is carports. They're going to try to put as much as they can on the roofs of the buildings. Unfortunately, only building 5 and building 6 are facing the right direction. The others are facing East and West and won't capture the sun enough. They will have to put as much as they can on the roofs.

Commissioner Broadhead asked about the meter for the solar.

Mr. Garcia said that each building will have a single net meter. They are still working it out with PGE though. Everything will be underground, and you won't see the conduits or anything.

Commissioner Cortes asked if there were any other questions of Mr. Garcia. Seeing none, the item was opened for public comment.

With nobody to speak on the item, it was returned to the Commission for further processing.

Commissioner Gran asked Mr. Chaffin if they need to take the motions separately.

Mr. Chaffin said they can be taken at the same time.

Commissioner Gran moved to approve Motion 1a and Motion 1b. Commissioner Salazar seconded the motions and they carried unanimously.

2. CUP 2020-01 – Vallarta Supermarket Type 21 ABC

A noticed public hearing to consider a conditional use permit to allow for the establishment of off-site alcohol sales as a component of a full-service supermarket located approximately 350 feet east of the southeast corner of Country Club Drive and West Clark Street (1467 Country Club Drive), in the C1 (Light Commercial) Zone District with a C (Commercial) General Plan land use designation (APN: 003-210-018). The project has been determined to be categorically exempt under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) guidelines, Section 15301 (Existing Facilities).

Darrell Unruh, Interim Planning Manager presented this item.

Commissioner Broadhead said it was mentioned that between this building and the apartment complex, there's a loading dock. Is the fence a sound barrier or how will it keep noise away from the complex?

Mr. Unruh said he believes it's a six-foot block wall.

Commissioner Gran said it's also raised. He was on the Commission when this site was approved, and they purposely did it like that to help block the noise.

Commissioner Broadhead asked if the trash was inside as well.

Mr. Unruh said he didn't look at that, but the applicant may be able to speak on it.

Commissioner Cortes opened the item for public comment and invited the applicant to the podium.

Karen Saito from Vallarta Supermarkets stepped to the podium. She is in charge of construction of the store and the real estate and is there on behalf of the company. She said they actually use a trash compactor. Once open there may be three pickups a week because of stocking the store, and then it will get down to one or two times per week. They are required by the state to do the organics. Those are in standard garbage cans and get picked up probably two to three times per week. That cuts down on the trash and the weight in the compactor also.

Commissioner Broadhead asked about the trash compactor and if it was the same area.

Mrs. Saito said it's the same compactor that Mervyn's had. There's also a bailer there too that they will be using. They are not changing anything though. It's inside the store though and not outside so it's way quieter.

Commissioner Gran confirmed the location of the restaurant.

Mrs. Saito continued to show the different areas of the store on the slide.

Commissioner Cortes asked where the emergency exits are.

Mrs. Saito pointed them out noting that they are also going to two entrances in the front as opposed to the one that Mervyn's had. She pointed out the emergency exits.

Commissioner Cortes said he was wondering because he worked at Food 4 Less about twenty years ago and people used to grab the liquor and run out the emergency exit.

Mrs. Saito reminded them that all the alcohol is locked up to prevent that from happening. There will also probably be about 90 cameras in the store. They have really good asset protection.

Commissioner Gran mentioned that he's very familiar with their stores. He's part of a BBQ team on the Central Coast. They use the store in Santa Maria because he found that their meat has to meet a higher standard to come across the border.

Mrs. Saito said that a typical store has about 200 employees unlike most stores. They make fresh tortillas on site. They have the bakery and butcher shop with an actual butcher that will cut anything you want. They listen to the community and research to try to bring the community what they want. They are very focused on customer service and a clean store. The owners of Vallarta are in almost every single store every single week. They are on the road all the time and it improves the quality control tremendously.

Commissioner Broadhead said he doesn't see the outside BBQ.

Mrs. Saito said she doesn't think that meets code, but they will have a sushi bar.

Commissioner Tyler asked if they will hire the 200 - 250 employees here or transfer from existing stores.

Mrs. Saito said they will hire locally except managers and supervisors will be transferred from existing stores to get this store opened initially.

Commissioner Broadhead asked when they planned on opening.

Mrs. Saito said that her target date is June. The building is really good structurally and its clean inside. They hired the Whole Foods designer, so it's going to be an upscale look inside. There will be food bars, homemade ice cream, a sushi bar etc. She thinks from start to finish they will spend somewhere between nine and ten million on this facility. They buy everything brand new they don't use cases from other stores or anything.

Commissioner Broadhead asked if the changes mentioned by Mr. Unruh were going to impact them.

Mrs. Saito said not at all.

Commissioner Gran confirmed they are in agreement with all the conditions including the modifications.

Mrs. Saito replied, yes.

With no further questions of Mrs. Saito, the item was opened for public comment.

Mr. Latiff of 2671 Marie Dr. in Madera stepped to the podium. He asked how far from the school this store was.

Commissioner Gran said the limit is 1000 feet and it's more than that.

the 99 Cent store had a lengthy discussion when they came to the Commission wanting to sell alcohol.

Commissioner Gran said that the difference between this one and the 99 Cent Store is that they didn't have all the safeguards and they didn't get a type 21. This license cost six figures to get and their operational goals and floor plan show they are very conscious of gran n go's and loss. Also, do you want people driving all over town making the same purchase they could have made here. There's not a Mexican restaurant in town that you can't buy beer at.

Mr. Unruh recommended that Mr. Latiff could ask his questions or give comment and they will respond. The first question was regarding proximity to the school and they are looking into it and will be responding.

With no further questions, the public comment was closed.

Mr. Unruh said he located Sherman Thomas school that is about a half mile to the Northeast. It's a little longer if you follow the path of travel using public rights of way.

Commissioner Gran said the new high school is probably the closest.

Commissioner Cortes said the only other one would be Pershing.

Commissioner Salazar said if the question from the public is; should we look at the pedestrian travel distance from a school to a liquor store, this is no difference from the one across the street. There is also one right across the street from the new high school. It's easier to get it there or at the corner of 17 and 26 than to travel down Country Club to this location. He said he's not concerned.

Commissioner Cortes said he would like to defer to the City Attorney.

Shannon Chaffin, Legal Counsel for the City of Madera said that ABC licenses are a little bit different than anything else in front of the Commission. ABC regulates licenses and the City regulates land uses. We don't directly regulate the sale of alcohol. However, through our land use powers we are capable of doing certain things, but it has to be supported by substantial evidence of this particular site. If we prohibit the off sale of alcohol, we have to have evidence that this site at this location is leading to crime and denial of this CUP would actually decrease crime and it must be supported by studies. Other jurisdictions that have done that have gone through quite a process as you can probably imagine. For this one ABC has stated there is not over concentration, it is within the required distance from schools and other public facilities. It meets the requirements of the City's Municipal Code as it relates to the ABC license and this location and use.

Commissioner Gran said the Police Dept. had a chance to respond and all they did was list the two years of issues but did not have a problem with the license.

Commissioner Salazar said he looked over that list and the bulk of the DUI concern is in the neighborhood to the East. He thinks it's a really nice project and he's happy to see something happening to the old Mervyn's building.

Mr. Unruh said he included that information so that it was consistent with the Commissions other applications. Tallying up the number of incidents over the past two years there is a slight reduction from the two years prior.

Commissioner Gran moved to approve Motion 1. Seconded by Commissioner Salazar, the motion carried unanimously.

Shannon Chaffin, Legal Counsel confirmed that included the modified conditions.

Commissioner Gran replied yes.

3. PPL 2020-01 – Rancho Santa Fe Precise Plan

A noticed public hearing to consider a precise plan proposing the development of seven home models on a 182-lot single family residential subdivision on approximately 38.5 acres located approximately 2,000 feet west of the southwest corner of the intersection of West Cleveland Avenue and North Westberry Boulevard in the PD-6000 (Planned Development) Zone District with an LD (Low Density) General Plan land use designation (APN's: 006-380-027 and 028). A Negative Declaration for the project was certified by the Planning Commission on November 13, 2018.

The item was presented by Jesus Orozco, Assistant Planner.

Commissioner Gran asked about the embellishments.

Mr. Orozco said that for the plan 1449, staff does recommend the ½ arch over the shutters. That one is a garage dominant model. The General Plan wants the living space to be the dominant focus. With the ½ arched windows it kind of detracts your vision from the garage and gives a focal point to the living space.

Commissioner Gran asked what he was referring to as the ½ arch.

Mr. Orozco said the window shutters and the other elevations for the Tuscan model do provide them but this one just seems to be missing them. The same idea applies to the rest. The 1773 is a garage neutral. The primary entrance is next to the garage. It goes back to what are you looking at first? The wainscoting will create a focal point to the entire architecture instead of just the garage.

Staff has worked with the applicant to reach some common ground. The applicant is in attendance. An additional condition was added regarding the requirement for park plans to be submitted to the City Engineer and Parks Director for review prior to the issuance of a building permit for the Subdivision. The subdivision includes a park and that will be reviewed and approved.

With no further questions of Mr. Orozco, the public hearing was opened, and the applicant was invited to the podium.

Zach Gomes from KB Home located at 744 P St. in Fresno, Ca. stepped to the podium. He said he appreciated working with Jesus. The responsiveness of staff is not something you normally get in this time. Being able to call and talk and get responses is very much appreciated.

Regarding the recommendation for shutters, he thinks that was an oversight of them not placing that on the 1449 plan. However, they believe the plans meet the guidelines and give pleasing features without adding additional brick. They like having a variation, it gives more of an appeal to the community. Not to mention it also adds cost to the elevations. Not an extraordinary amount but every little bit makes a difference and makes the homes less affordable to the residents. Some of the plans they already build in Fresno, Southern California, Sacramento, Roseville, etc. KB just recommends that they do not implement the recommendations of adding brick to the exterior elevations.

Commissioner Gran asked Mr. Orozco to put the elevations back up so Mr. Gomes can show them.

Mr. Gomes said some of the elevations like the B elevation, there's brick on both sides of the garage and the entry column. Jesus is asking for brick at the living window area. If you look at the other elevations some will have it in the living area and some not on the garage area, it just varies on the plan and elevation on where it's located. Adding more can make the homes a little less affordable for the residents.

Commissioner Gran asked about the front yards being landscaped and the backyards being upgradable with patios, etc.

Mr. Gomes said yes, they have two patio options. Approximately 10x10 and another that is approximately 10x20 just depending on the rear of the house with the rear slider and windows.

Commissioner Gran said he also noticed the setbacks are varied. He confirmed there's not an issue with the shutters on the one, and that the issue is really elevation b.

Mr. Gomes said that is correct. The one was an oversight.

Commissioner Gran asked what the price point is.

Mr. Gomes said that the smallest plan is about 258-260 range base price plus they can pick options. They can buy the base house or upgrade cabinets, flooring, etc.

Commissioner Cortes asked about the wainscoting.

Mr. Gomes said the wainscoting is not an option but it's an option per elevation.

Commissioner Gran asked about the price for the big one.

Mr. Gomes said it's right around the 300 to 320 range. The buyer can only afford so much. They build toward the market not what it's going to cost them to build.

Commissioner Salazar asked how many phases this would be built in.

Mr. Gomes said they are building in one phase. There will be a parking lot with two sales offices, two models for the 5000 sq. ft. lots and another for the 6000 sq. ft. lots. Two different sales agents for each model and showing 4 total plans out of the 7 they offer.

Commissioner Salazar asked if there will be a well there for water.

Mr. Gomes said the City has confirmed there is enough water supply to serve the community.

Commissioner Broadhead confirmed they will have solar as well.

Mr. Gomes said yes, there will be solar on every plan, and the buyer can either lease at no cost or buy the panels. Typically, only about 8-10 percent actually purchase the solar. They want to spend more on the cabinets, flooring, etc.

Commissioner Lopez asked about the additional cost to the buyer.

Mr. Gomes said that if they lease it doesn't cost them anything but if they want to buy yes it will cost them.

Commissioner Lopez asked for an idea on the price of the solar.

Mr. Gomes said most likely it will be about 8-12 thousand.

Commissioner Salazar confirmed that was to purchase.

Mr. Gomes said yes, on top of the price.

Commissioner Lopez said since it's a requirement to have solar and they don't want to buy them they would have to lease them.

Mr. Gomes said that's correct.

Commissioner Salazar said that on homes it's typically 80-90 something dollars for the lease payment. Which is about 1/3 of a regular pge payment. Assuming 8 panels minimum and maybe up to 16 on the bigger models.

Mr. Gomes said typically they build over energy code anyway. All of the homes are energy star rated. They are the builder that has the longest tenure for energy star rated homes. They show kind of a miles per gallon, as a car would when you buy it, for their homes on gas and electric with an EPG model.

Commissioner Salazar asked about the green space and what the plan was.

Mr. Gomes said they have met with Mr. Scarborough in the Parks Dept. about what he would like to see. They're landscape consultant is coming up with a preliminary plan showing a tot lot with a play structure, drinking fountain, benches and trash receptacles. They are building a 2.1- acre park on their piece. The flop of that which appears to be a little bigger to the East, is owned by another person. Whoever builds that piece will have to buy the other ½. There is a tentative map that has expired. They will be talking to City staff to see that ties in well and to see about reinstating the map.

Commissioner Gran said there's a prior development that feels they were promised a park and they don't have one, so we want to avoid that.

Mr. Gomes said there will be a park, it's in the conditions and in their budget.

Commissioner Gran confirmed with Mr. Gomes he is in agreement with all the conditions including the one regarding the addition of the park.

Mr. Gomes said he agrees with everything but was hoping to work on is the one requiring the brick.

Mr. Orozco said that is condition #18. He believes the only exception would be the Tuscan elevation. The applicant is requesting they remove the brick wainscoting on three elevations.

Commissioner Salazar confirmed that the motion either needs to amend the condition or approve it as is.

Commissioner Broadhead said he doesn't see the access to the neighborhood. There's an access off Cleveland but where else.

Mr. Gomes said they are tying into Melanie Meadows on the South and to the North on Cleveland. If that tie in point on the South is not available for some reason, the Fire Dept. said there will need to be a second point of access. They will probably be paved sometime in April and we won't be paving until sometime in May or June.

Commissioner Broadhead asked what if it was built tomorrow there would only be one point of access?

Mr. Gomes said if it was built tomorrow, they would have to put a second point of access somewhere in the community to meet the fire requirements.

Commissioner Gran asked if there would be a traffic light at the Cleveland end. There's a lot of cars going in and out of one driveway.

Mr. Helmuth said the driveway is a left in and right out. It's designed that way because it's fairly close to the next major arterial to the West. Until something develops to the West, which is Village D. There are two other connections in there, and it's proposed to have four. At some point there will probably be a median island break on Cleveland Avenue just East of the site.

Commissioner Salazar said he appreciates the design of the subdivision. The streets are curved and not a grid.

With no further questions of the applicant the public hearing was closed, and the item was returned to the Commission for further processing.

Commissioner Gran asked how the other Commissioners felt about #18.

Commissioner Salazar said he would like to propose per the applicant's request, not having the wainscoting.

Commissioner Gran confirmed that was on the bottom three; the 1773, 1996 and 2148.

He feels there's enough difference. Sometimes if there's too much it becomes repetitive and the same as if it was just stucco. He understands staff wanting differences when there's not so many options, but with the applicant providing 7 different plans and different elevations with different setbacks he thinks they can mitigate having to do one with wainscoting.

Commissioner Gran said based on their past performance they provide a good product with varied detail.

Mr. Orozco added that not all 7 elevations are buildable on all lots. Only the smaller ones are buildable on just about all lots, and the larger ones are not. In terms of providing the maximum variation among the elevations, staff would recommend you consider what they look like.

Commissioner Gran asked Mr. Orozco which one's are the plans that could be built on the bottom lots.

Mr. Orozco said the more grid like parcels are the smaller lots and then there's a few that run along the west side.

Commissioner Gran asked which floor plans would work on those small lots.

Mr. Orozco said the 1384 model will fit on 100% of the lots, the 1449 model on 95% and the 1557 on 95%. That's based on there being some oddly configured lots. Especially the one's in a cul-de-sac. The smaller models should fit on just about every lot but then again, there's only three of those.

On page two of the staff report, the top three floor plans would fit on just about every lot. The four larger floor plans would only fit on the larger lots.

Commissioner Cortes reopened the public hearing and the applicant returned to the podium.

Mr. Gomes said that just to confirm; the larger lots are on the south side, smaller lots on the north side. They took this community to their corporate land committee for approval. when they took this project, they had one sales office and three to four models, one product line. The CEO said he wanted two product lines, the 1773, 1860, 1996 and 2148 fit on the larger lots. That's why they are doing a sales office for that one and they're doing another separate sales office for the smaller lots. The 1384, 1449 and 1557 fit on the smaller lots. That's how they plan on running the community. It's almost like two separate communities.

Commissioner Cortes thanked Mr. Gomes and closed the public hearing returning the item to the Commission for further processing.

Commissioner Gran said he understands what staff is trying to do and he also understands what they're trying to do.

Commissioner Salazar said if you look at new Parkwood, it was built in three or four phases. The first phase was one builder and it's all Tuscan style up until you get to about Stanford Avenue. Then one block over you have a mix of two story and single story, different builder. There's not a blend of the different styles. Even if it's three or four in the front and a different three or four in the back there's still some blend.

Commissioner Gran said there's also a price point and you can probably get closer to the median income of Madera with the smaller homes. He agrees to the modification of the Tuscan. He asked Mr. Gomes, if a customer wanted the wainscoting all the way around, would they do it.

Mr. Gomes said no, it wouldn't be an option.

Commissioner Gran said you can go through subdivisions and see that some people have more money because they have done things all the way around the house.

Commissioner Salazar said that staff's recommendation is only to differentiate.

Commissioner Gran said he thinks it's to improve the appeal also. He asked how the Commission wanted to craft #18 or do they want to touch it.

Commissioner Broadhead said he thinks it can be removed.

Commissioner Salazar agreed.

Commissioner Gran moved to approve Motion 1 with the modification to #18 removing brick wainscoting from the condition and to add #38 as stated in the presentation. Seconded by Commissioner Broadhead, the motion carried unanimously.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS:

Mr. Orozco said for those Commissioners going to the Commissioners Academy, thank you. Staff encourages all Commissioners take advantage of it. For the next year if there is sufficient budget all are encouraged to participate.

Commissioner Gran asked who is going.

Commissioner Salazar said he's going

Commissioner Gran asked if that was it.

Commissioner Lopez said he was going to go but had to request cancellation.

Commissioner Gran said he has gone several times and would recommend it.

Commissioner Lopez said he thinks it's a great idea if you can attend.

Mr. Orozco said that being a Commissioner is a serious commitment to the Community.

Mr. Unruh said that if they find any other available trainings, we will let them know.

Mr. Orozco noted there is a lot of planning that goes into preparing a planning commission so please respond to the emails that you will be in attendance. Some applicants come from out of town and if there's not quorum they drove and wasted their time.

Commissioner Gran said to Mr. Helmuth that he has had some concerned citizens approach him regarding trees lifting up the sidewalk. Who would he talk to about that?

Mr. Helmuth said its kind of complicated, but the property owners are responsible for the sidewalk and curb and gutter. Someone could complain to the City and then the property owner is noticed and given 15 days to fix it.

Commissioner Lopez asked if a permit would be required if the property owner is responsible for getting permits.

Mr. Helmuth said yes, that is correct.

Shannon Chaffin, Legal Counsel said that if there are important questions, we can put an item on the next agenda to address questions. Otherwise staff will be available after the meeting to answer questions. Only the reports are on the agenda.

The Brown Act wants to give the public notice about what is going to be discussed.

COMMISSIONER REPORTS:

None

ADJOURNMENT: 7:00 pm



Planning Commission Chairperson



Brandi Garcia, Recording Secretary