

To: Christopher Boyle, Planning Manager
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
CC: Wendy Silva
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Planning Manager classification. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

Madera's Planning Manager, under general direction, performs a variety of supervisory, administrative and technical work in the development, implementation, and maintenance of current and long range plans; implements departmental policies and procedures; coordinates activities with other divisions, City departments, outside agencies, and organizations; organizes, supervises, reviews, and participates in the work of professional, technical, and office support staff; and makes recommendations to the City Council and Planning commission on planning issues. The Planning Manager is a division manager within the Community Development Department who exercises full responsibility for planning, organizing, and directing the work activities of the Planning Division staff and acts as Secretary of the Planning Commission. This class reports to the Director of Community Development (although description states City Administrator).

1. City of Merced: The Merced position is a mid-management position wherein the description and responsibilities don't cleanly align with the responsibilities of the Madera Planning Manager post. Moreover, the salary schedule is dated from 2008 and not representative of a current salary schedule. The position is not a valid comparator.

K&A Response: The Planning Manager, under general direction, plans, organizes, directs, and manages programs in the Planning Division; performs the most complex professional City planning functions; and administers planning studies, environmental reviews, and community design. This class reports to the Director of Development Services. We acknowledge that there will not be an exact, 100% match between the classification at the comparator agency and at Madera.

When we do our analysis and make our recommended match we want at least a 70% match in terms of the whole position including factors such as:

- Definition and typical job functions;
- Distinguishing characteristics;
- Level within a class series (i.e. entry, experienced, journey, specialist, lead, etc.);
- Reporting relationship structure (for example, manages through lower-level staff)
- Education and experience requirements;
- Knowledge, abilities, and skills required to perform the work;
- The scope and complexity of the work;



- Independence of action/responsibility;
- The authority delegated to make decisions and take action;
- The responsibility for the work of others, program administration, and for budget dollars;
- Problem solving/ingenuity;
- Contacts with others (both inside and outside of the organization);
- Consequences of action and decisions; and
- Working conditions.

With that said, we feel that overall the Planning Manager at Merced is at least a 70% match in terms of these factors. Additionally, there is one (1) Planning Manager at the City and according to the budget, the Director of Development Services is only allocated to Planning at 0.3 FTE. In other words, the Planning Manager has primary management responsibility for the Planning Division.

Finally, we want to acknowledge that even though the City of Merced has not given a salary range adjustment since 2008 that does not mean that the Planning Manager is not a match to Madera's Planning Manager. The classifications are comparable based on the factors analyzed above.

2. City of Fresno: The Fresno position is also a mid-management position that has responsibilities far less rigorous than the Madera Planning Manager position. The Fresno position is not even the top position within the Planning Department, and does not answer directly to a Community Development Director or similar position. To assume this position would be a demotion. The position is not a valid comparator.

K&A Response: The Planning Manager, under direction, plans and directs the operations of either the Advance or Current Planning Program within the Development Department. The Planning Manager reports to the Deputy Director of Planning and directs either the Advance or Current Planning Program within the Planning Division. The incumbent oversees subordinate staff engaged in the full range of government planning services including research related to the collection and analysis of physical, demographic, and socio-economic data; the formulation and updating of the City's General Plan, community plans, and specific plans; the processing of plan amendments, annexations, rezonings, subdivisions, conditional use permits, site plans, variances, minor deviations, environmental assessments/impact reports, and municipal code/zoning ordinance amendments; and serving plan implementation/citizen advisory committees; and performing public counter customer services.

Per the current budget, the Assistant Director Development Services oversees Current Planning Services and Building & Safety Services. This is a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera's Planning Manager (and has a separate Chief Building Official classification). Additionally, the Assistant Director Neighborhood Services oversees housing development, community revitalization, long-range planning, historic preservation, and sustainable programs. Similar to the Assistant Director Development Services, this class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera's Planning Manager.

There are currently two (2) incumbents allocated to the Planning Manager classification with one assigned to Current Planning and one assigned to Advanced Planning. We understand that Madera's Planning Manager has management responsibility for both current and advanced planning programs and thus we feel that the functional scope of responsibility of the Planning Manager at Madera is greater than that of the Planning Manager at Fresno. Thus, we will remove the Planning Manager as a match and change the match to N/C.

3. City of Porterville: The Porterville position is within a governmental structure that is not closely aligned to the Madera structure. The structure of the development services departments differs dramatically in scope and size. Responsibilities of the City Planner do not closely match to the Planning Manager position. The salary listed was not adopted in 2015, but instead in 2007.

K&A Response: The City Planner, under the general direction of the Community Development Director, plans, organizes, and directs the City's current and advanced planning programs; represents the City in planning related matters with City Council, Commissions, other organizations and agencies; performs advanced professional municipal planning work; oversees and participates in the development and implementation of the General Plan, City Ordinances, and other planning polices, evaluates and processes current land use projects; and supervises subordinate professional and/or other staff. The City Planner is currently not filled but is allocated to a salary range. The last salary range adjustments were given in January 2015. We are not sure where the 2007 reference is coming from (the class description was last revised in 2007), but in any case, as with Fresno, the date of the last salary range adjustments would not disqualify a classification as a match. Overall, we feel based on an analysis of the whole position that the City Planner is an appropriate match to Madera's Planning Manager.

As a note, we also relooked at the matches at Manteca and Turlock even though you were in agreement with both of these matches. Similar to the matches at Fresno and Porterville, both report to a Director classification and are considered management or mid-management (versus senior or executive management).

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Fresno	Planning Manager	N/C

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Daniel Foss, President of Madera Police Officers Association
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects various City classifications. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. In the survey I noted that you selected 10 other cities in which to compare with most of the positions in the city. However, on several positions (in particular Director of Human Resources, City Attorney and Director of Community Development) I noted that you only compared them to four other cities. Interestingly, these positions show as the most underpaid positions within the City by leaving out six cities.

I see that the vacant positions are listed as N/C, which I understand is not compatible. But I contacted some of the cities that were left out and obtained the job description for these positions. For example, Clovis (which was listed as N/C for HR) has a human resource manager and the job description is nearly identical to our HR Director. Same goes for Lodi. Both of these cities, if included, would have lowered the average and median rate. Is there a reason that these were not included?

If it is due to vast differences in the in expectations of the positions, is there a reason why the rest of the city employees were not spoken to? Thank you for your time and please let me know if you need any more information from me.

K&A Response: When we do our analysis and make our recommended match we want at least a 70% match in terms of the whole position including factors such as:

- Definition and typical job functions;
- Distinguishing characteristics;
- Level within a class series (i.e. entry, experienced, journey, specialist, lead, etc.);
- Reporting relationship structure (for example, manages through lower-level staff)
- Education and experience requirements;
- Knowledge, abilities, and skills required to perform the work;
- The scope and complexity of the work;
- Independence of action/responsibility;
- The authority delegated to make decisions and take action;
- The responsibility for the work of others, program administration, and for budget dollars;
- Problem solving/ingenuity;
- Contacts with others (both inside and outside of the organization);
- Consequences of action and decisions; and
- Working conditions.



The difference in size of organization becomes more important when comparing classes at the management level. The scope of work and responsibility for management becomes much larger as an organization grows (and the opposite with smaller organizations). Factors such as management of a large staff, consequence of error, the political nature of the job, and its visibility all grow with larger organizations (and the opposite with smaller organizations). When it is difficult to find agencies that are similarly sized, it is important to get a good balance of smaller and larger agencies.

For the purposes of review of the matches, all employee stakeholders received the draft spreadsheets at the same time. In other words, management did not review or provide feedback regarding the matches before all other stakeholders had a chance to review the data.

With that said, we did reanalyze the matches (and non-matches or N/C) for the Director of Human Resources, as well as other management and mid-management classifications. Some of the matches (and non-matches) were updated based on the additional analysis.

In regards to the City Attorney, the N/C were recommended since these cities outsourced this function and in one case the City Attorney is a part-time classification. In regards to the Director of Community Development, in the last study we conducted in 2008-09 we received feedback that this class functioned as an Assistant City Manager, in addition to overseeing engineering, planning, building inspection and compliance, and capital facility planning. Thus many of our matches included not only the Director overseeing these functional areas but also the Assistant or Deputy City Manager (with the exception of Merced and Turlock since both have similar functional responsibilities and/or serving as the City Manager in his or her absence).

Also, we had a phone conversation and we discussed issues such as the matches to the Police Commander, deferred compensation reported for POA sworn staff, City health insurance contributions, and Fresno retirement. Here is some follow-up to our conversation:

- Police Commander: In regards to the Police Commander we reanalyzed the matches and made some updates. Additionally, we wanted to note that this class was not included in the previous study.
- Deferred Compensation: We removed the deferred compensation contribution for POA sworn classifications.
- Health Insurance: We understand that Madera's health insurance contribution is a significant contributor as to why the benefits package is richer when compared to the comparator agencies. As discussed the health contribution is an outlier compared to the market. We also discussed that the membership of POA is split between the higher cost and lower cost plans and that the City would be getting rid of the higher cost plan. For the purposes of this study, we consistently reported for all agencies the maximum dollar amount each agency contributed toward health insurance. It is appropriate for us to report the same for Madera. Also, per a follow-up conversation with Human Resources it does not appear that the City will be getting rid of the higher cost plan. Thus we are not going to change the amount reported for Madera pertaining to health insurance contributions.



- Fresno Retirement: We reviewed the retirement formula provided to safety employees and the formula offered is equivalent to PERS enhanced formula of 2%@50. We will add the associated cost with this enhanced formula (9.5%). In addition we looked into the issue regarding the Deferred Retirement Option Program (DROP) program. DROP is a voluntary program. Employees who elect to participate cannot work for the City more than 10 years after date of joining DROP. Any Plan member who has not retired, who is at least age 50, and has completed at least 10 years of service (Tier I member) or 5 years of service (Tier II member), can elect to participate in DROP. Program participants:
 - Stop earning any other benefits under the Plan (although employee still receives cost-of-living adjustments in your monthly DROP deposit, if applicable).
 - Stop making contributions to the Plan.
 - Begin earning DROP benefits in a DROP account held in employee's name. Each month, the Plan will credit your DROP account with the monthly service retirement benefit that the employee had earned before joining DROP. Each month, the account will be credited with interest. The Retirement Board determines the interest rate for each fiscal year (July 1 to June 30). At retirement, the employee has the right to the dollar value of the account through the various DROP distribution options available.
 - Begin to receive your service retirement benefits on or before the target retirement date. When the employee retires, the employee can elect to receive your DROP account as a lump-sum payment, as monthly payments, roll the account to an IRA, or a combination of these options.

When the employees participates in DROP, the Plan treats the employee as if the employee is retired for purposes of calculating the monthly retirement benefit. Any service the employee completes with the City after joining DROP and any salary increases after that date are not used in calculating the monthly retirement benefit. Instead, the Plan calculates the benefit using salary and service credit as of the date joining DROP. When the employee leaves City employment and end the DROP participation, the retirement benefit consists of both the monthly retirement benefit described above and a distribution of the balance in the DROP account. Based on our understanding of the program, the costs associated with the DROP benefit is that it is cost neutral to the City and so would not have an additional cost associated with the benefit, similar to other optional benefits like enhanced formulas.

Per our understanding of this benefit is an optional benefit that the employee elects to participate in and is not a benefit provided to all employees, like an enhanced formula of 2%@50. Additionally, actuarial studies conducted on DROP benefit has indicated that the benefit is cost neutral to the City (this was also confirmed by a Human Resources representative). Thus there is no additional cost to the employer to be reported for the DROP benefit.

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Dino Lawson
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
CC: Wendy Silva
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Police Commander. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. I disagree with utilizing the classification of Lieutenant as comparable to the Madera Police Department Commander.

K&A Response: Per the Police Commander classification description, this class under general direction, administers a division of the Police Department including uniformed patrol, detectives, task force, community services and reserves, budget, communications, property/evidence, facilities, and equipment and telecommunications maintenance; implements departmental policies and procedures; coordinates activities with other divisions, City departments, outside agencies and organizations; and performs complex and highly responsible planning and supervisory duties associated with the crime prevention and law enforcement activities of the City. A typical way of obtaining the required qualifications is to possess 5 years of increasingly responsible law enforcement experience, including 2 years in a supervisory capacity comparable to that of a Police Sergeant with the City of Madera, and a Bachelor's degree in criminology, police sciences or a related field. Requires possession of a supervisory certificate.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Police Commander and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was Police Lieutenant. The Police Lieutenant, under administrative direction, plans, directs, manages, supervises, and coordinates the activities and operations of an assigned service area within the Police Division of the Public Safety Department; coordinates assigned activities with other divisions, departments, and outside agencies; and provides highly responsible and complex administrative support to higher ranks as assigned. There are currently 2 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 50 sworn staff through Sergeants). The Police Captain, under administrative direction, directs, manages, supervises, and coordinates the activities, staffing, resources and operations of the City's Police Department; provides and oversees full-service law enforcement, field operations, criminal investigations, crime prevention, dispatch services, disaster preparedness and response, community problem-solving, code enforcement, general community support services, and related support services; coordinates assigned activities with other divisions, departments, and outside agencies; and provides highly responsible and complex administrative support to the Chief of Police. Currently the Police Captain classification is



vacant and not assigned to a salary range. The City did not have a job description available for the Deputy Police Chief.

The public safety organizational structure at City of Ceres is different from Madera in that police and fire are within a single department, Department of Public Safety, and the Director of Public Safety/Police Chief has management for the both and police and fire services. Thus, the Deputy Police Chief is responsible for management of the entire Police Division (all police operations). The Lieutenants, then have responsibility for management of an assigned service area within the Police Division. In terms of organizational structure, management authority, and scope of responsibility the Police Lieutenant at Ceres is comparable to Madera's Police Commander. We will not change the match.

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain. The Police Captain, under general direction, serves as Division Commander having direct administrative control of a police division and performs specialized law enforcement and administrative work. There are currently 3 Police Captains (as a note: overseeing 96 sworn staff through Lieutenants and Sergeants). The Police Lieutenant, under direction, commands unit activities within the Police Department. Since the Police Captain has management of a division within the department we feel that this is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain and Police Lieutenant. The Police Captain, under direction, plans, organizes, and directs police operations in a policing district within the Field Operations Division of the Fresno Police Department and performs law enforcement duties in the protection of life and property. There are 8 Police Captains. The Police Lieutenant, under direction, plans, organizes, and supervises a bureau, a section of a bureau, serves as a District Commander, Field Commander, Watch Commander, or serves in the Office of the Chief of Police and performs law enforcement duties in the protection of life and property. There are 18 Police Lieutenants. The Deputy Police Chief, under general direction, administers the activities of one of the Department's divisions and performs law enforcement duties in the protection of life and property. There are 4 Deputy Police Chiefs. There are 4 divisions (Patrol, Support & Special Services, Investigative, and Administrative Services) with a total of 717 sworn positions in the Department including all levels of sworn classifications.

Fresno is a much larger city compared to Madera in terms of population and police staff, as well as with a Uniform Crime Reporting (violent crimes) almost five times that of Madera. The difference in organizational size and population served is significant and thus although the Deputy Police Chief has divisional management responsibility we do not think that it is comparable to Madera's Police Commander. However we understand that the Lieutenant at Fresno manages a bureau and/or section of a bureau and so has a smaller scope and level of responsibility compared to Madera's Police Commander. Thus we will remove the Lieutenant as match and only report the Police Captain as a match.



- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain. The Police Captain, under administrative direction to assist in planning, organizing, coordinating, and managing the city's law enforcement activities; maintains general charge of services to primary department functions; and assumes departmental command as assigned. The Police Lieutenant, under administrative direction to serve as the commanding officer during an assigned shift or as a unit Lieutenant; performs administrative police duties and supervise the operations and personnel of a division; provides highly responsible and complex staff assistance; and ensures operational efficiency and achievement of goals and objectives. There are 2 Police Captains and 2 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 46 sworn staff through Sergeants). Since the Police Captain has management of primary department functions, whereas the Lieutenant has management of a shift or unit, we feel that the Captain is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain. The Police Captain, under administrative direction, plans, organizes, and directs the work of a division of the Police Department and provides responsible and technical assistance to the Police Chief. The Police Lieutenant, under direction, supervises and coordinates the activities and personnel during an assigned shift and supervises and administers the department during off-duty hours of higher ranking officers. There are 2 Police Captains and 5 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 65 sworn staff through Sergeants). Since the Police Captain has management of a division within the department we feel that this is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain. The Police Captain, under the direction of the Police Chief, plans, organizes, and directs the operations and activities related to police protection and other law enforcement services to safeguard the lives, property, and constitutional rights of the citizens of Manteca; coordinates and manages the programs of assigned division of the Department to assure timely response to crime and accident scenes, emergency situations, and other requests for assistance and proper enforcement of State, County, and City laws and ordinances; and trains and supervises the performance of assigned personnel. The Police Lieutenant, under the direction of the Police Captain, coordinates, plans, organizes, and directs the operations of a police unit or team in performing police protection and other law enforcement services to safeguard the lives, property, and constitutional rights of the citizens of Manteca; coordinates and manages the programs of assigned unit or team to assure timely response to crime and accident scenes, emergency situations, and other requests for assistance; trains and provides work direction to assigned staff; and coordinates and manages programs and projects of a police unit or team. There are 2 Police Captains and 0 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 61 sworn staff through Sergeants). Since the Police Captain has management of a division within the department we feel that this is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Police Captain. The Police Captain, under general direction, to plan, organize, direct, and review the work



of one of the 3 divisions of the Merced Police Department (Administrative, Investigations, and Operations); provides supervision and training for assigned staff; and performs a broad range of complex law enforcement and crime prevention work, including patrol, investigations, and special assignments. The Police Lieutenant, under general direction, performs responsible administrative and technical work for the Police Department and exercises direct supervision over sworn and non-sworn personnel. There are 2 Police Captains and 3 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 73 sworn staff through Sergeants). Since the Police Captain has management of a division within the department we feel that this is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Police Lieutenant. The Police Lieutenant, under direction, serves as the commanding officer during an assigned shift or serves as a division commander; performs administrative police duties and supervises the operations and personnel of a division. The Police Captain, under general direction, assists in planning, organizing, coordinating, and managing the City's law enforcement activities; maintains general charge of services related to primary departmental functions; and assumes departmental command as assigned. There are 3 Police Captains and 2 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 57 sworn staff through Sergeants). There are 3 divisions (Investigative, Patrol, and Services) within the Department. Although the description reads that the Lieutenants manages a division as a Division Commander, the current organization structure is that there is a Captain allocated to manage each division. Thus the Police Captain is more comparable to Madera's Police Commander and so we will change the match from Police Lieutenant to Police Captain.
- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was Police Lieutenant. The Police Lieutenant, under general direction; plans, schedules, trains, deploys, organizes, supervises, and reviews the work of officers and non-sworn staff on an assigned shift; trains staff and provides for their professional development; develops and implements specific departmental operational programs; provides complex administrative and budgetary support to the Police Chief and Police Captain; and coordinates assigned activities with other divisions, outside agencies, and the general public. The Police Captain, under general direction, directs, manages, organizes, reviews, and evaluates the programs and activities of multiple divisions of the Police Department through subordinate levels of supervision; develops and implements specific departmental operational programs; provides complex administrative and budgetary support to the Police Chief; coordinates assigned activities with other City departments; and acts for the Chief on a relief or as assigned basis. There are 3 Police Captains and 4 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 67 sworn staff through Sergeants). There are 3 divisions (Investigations, Patrol, and Administration) within the Department. Although the Police Captain description reads that this class manages multiple divisions, the current organization structure is that there is 1 Captain allocated to each division. Thus the Police Captain is more comparable to Madera's Police Commander and so we will change the match from Police Lieutenant to Police Captain.



- City of Turlock:** The K&A recommended match was Police Lieutenant and Police Captain. The Police Lieutenant, under general direction, plans, directs, and reviews the activities of the police department field operations and special operations divisions; provides direction to meet City and Department goals; and coordinates with other service areas, agencies, boards, commissions, and the public; generally functions as a shift watch commander. The Police Captain, under general direction of the Chief of Police, maintains oversight and leads the activities of one of 3 major Divisions comprising the Turlock Police Department; provides direction to meet City goals; and coordinates with other service areas, agencies, boards, commissions, and the public; may act for the Police Chief, as needed. There are 2 Police Captains and 4 Police Lieutenants (as a note: overseeing 67 sworn staff through Sergeants). Although both class descriptions refer to management of divisions within the Department, the current Department organization includes 2 Divisions (Field Operations and Special Operations) with a Captain assigned to manage each division. Thus the Police Captain is more comparable to Madera’s Police Commander and so we will remove the Police Lieutenant from the recommended match.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Ceres	Police Lieutenant	Police Lieutenant
Clovis	Police Captain	Police Captain
Fresno	Police Captain / Police Lieutenant	Police Captain
Hanford	Police Captain	Police Captain
Lodi	Police Captain	Police Captain
Manteca	Police Captain	Police Captain
Merced	Police Captain	Police Captain
Porterville	Police Lieutenant	Police Captain
Tulare	Police Lieutenant	Police Captain
Turlock	Police Lieutenant	Police Captain

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Mid-Management Group
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the various mid-management classifications. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager: “Through a cursory look at the salary survey for the WWTP Manager, I see that they used the title of Superintendent in over 50% of the Cities surveyed. Generally, the superintendent reports to the manager so, the superintendent is not necessarily the responsible manager... There are in fact, in the N/C Cities, comparable positions with similar duties and responsibilities for both; only the job titles are different.”

K&A Response: The Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager, under general direction, supervises, evaluates, plans and organizes the mechanical maintenance operations and repairs of the City’s wastewater treatment plant and facilities; oversees laboratory operations and testing; assists in the preparation and administration of the division budget; evaluates and trains assigned staff; interfaces with and coordinates assigned functions with other City services and departments; represents plant operations with government control agencies; ensures safe work practices, work quality and accuracy. This class requires possession of a Grade IV Certification as a Wastewater Plant Operator from the California State Water Quality Control Board.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Wastewater Systems Supervisor organizes, monitors, and supervises the City’s wastewater treatment facility and sewer system. This class requires a Grade III Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. This class does not have the same level of management responsibility as Madera’s Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. The Supervisor reports to the Deputy Director of Public Works who manages water, wastewater, streets, parks, facilities, and fleet divisions. The Deputy Director has a much broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera’s Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. Neither the Supervisor or Deputy Director (or bracketed match of both) are comparable. We will not change the N/C.
- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Utilities Manager, under administrative direction, organizes and supervises the maintenance and operation of the wastewater collection system, the potable water distribution system, and the reclaimed water distribution system and related facilities; inspects water main and sewer main construction and equipment for conformance with plans, specifications, City codes and laws; and maintains a



budget. This class has a broader scope of responsibility in regards to not only managing wastewater treatment (services of which are limited to a portion of the City and not a citywide service) but also managing potable water distribution, wastewater collection, and reclaimed water distribution systems. This is not an appropriate match to Madera's Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. We will not change the N/C.

- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Wastewater Superintendent. The Wastewater Superintendent is responsible for planning, organizing, and setting goals for the wastewater division. This class requires a Grade III Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. This class reports to the Director of Public Works (not a manager). Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Wastewater Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Wastewater Plant Superintendent. The Wastewater Plant Superintendent, under general direction, this position plans, directs and reviews the operation of the City's Class IV wastewater treatment plant, which includes the directing of operations related to the chemical, physical and bacteriological laboratory analysis to assure compliance with quality control and certification standards. This class requires a Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. This class reports to the Deputy Public Works Director – Utilities who is responsible for water and wastewater operations (total of 53 staff). This class has a broader scope of responsibility and is not comparable to Madera's Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Wastewater Plant Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Wastewater System Superintendent. The Wastewater System Superintendent, under the direction of the Public Works Deputy Director-Utility Services, plans, organizes, and directs the laboratory, operations, and activities related to the maintenance and repair of City wastewater, water, and storm water systems, facilities, and related equipment; coordinates and manages the development and implementation of Department guidelines and procedures to assure compliance with established local, State, and federal laws, codes, and regulations; and trains and evaluates the performance of assigned personnel. This class requires a Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. The Public Works Deputy Director – Utility Services manages the construction, installation, maintenance and repair operations and activities of the Water, Wastewater, Solid Waste, Streets, Building Maintenance and Vehicle Maintenance divisions of the Public Works department. This class has a broader scope of responsibility and is not comparable to Madera's Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Wastewater System Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.



- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Wastewater Treatment Plant Superintendent. The Wastewater Treatment Plant Superintendent plans, organizes, directs, coordinates, and supervises day-to-day activities of the City Wastewater Treatment Plant and related facilities to ensure efficient wastewater treatment, effluent quality, and effluent disposal in compliance with state and federal regulations and standards. This class requires a Grade V Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. This class reports to the Public Works Manager – Wastewater responsible for planning, organizing, and coordinating the activities of the wastewater division; develops and implements general policy directives for wastewater collections, treatment, and recycling; and is designated Chief Plant Operator. This class requires a Grade V Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. Organizationally, the Public Works Manager has a greater scope of management responsibility in the class oversees the treatment plant operations and maintenance through the Superintendent and Supervisors. However we want to acknowledge that the Public Works Manager – Wastewater is responsible for managing the wastewater treatment plant operations and maintenance and so we will add the Public Works Manager – Wastewater to the match.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Wastewater Utilities Superintendent. The Wastewater Utilities Superintendent, under general direction, plans, organizes, and administers the program of public service involving maintenance and repair of sewer mains, lift stations, storm drain system lines, lagoon, and operation and maintenance of the City’s wastewater treatment facility. This class requires a Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator certificate. This class reports to the Field Services Manager responsible for planning, organizing, and directing the City’s field services which may include solid waste collection and recycling, maintenance of street, sewer, storm drainage system, water production and distribution, traffic signal systems, wastewater treatment plant, environmental laboratory, and fleet operations (there are currently no Field Services Manager positions filled). The Field Services Manager has a broader scope of responsibility and is not comparable to Madera’s Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Wastewater Utilities Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Fresno	Wastewater Treatment Plant Superintendent	Wastewater Treatment Plant Superintendent / Public Works Manager - Wastewater

- Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager: “The comparators used for the Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager only compared those in charge of building maintenance, none included the industrial electrical oversight in their position at such locations at the WWTP and wells among others. And all but one of the building

maintenance positions were at the Supervisor level, not Managerial. For example the City of Turlock has a Utility Manager that would better fit for comparison instead of the lower and unequal position of Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor.”

K&A Response: The Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager, under direction, supervises, evaluates and participates in the work of crews responsible for construction, repair, and maintenance work in the City’s buildings, electrical systems, facilities, and structures; ensures safe work practices, work quality and accuracy; maintains appropriate work records which may include time cards and work orders; serves as a technical resource for assigned work crews.

Overall, it was difficult to find classifications at these agencies that were responsible for electrical system maintenance of utility (water and wastewater) infrastructure and facilities. Many times, management responsibility for these functions were assumed by an operations manager or similar classification.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was Facility Maintenance Supervisor. The Facility Maintenance Supervisor, under general direction, organizes, monitors, and supervises facility maintenance operations; performs a variety of technical tasks relative to facility maintenance. This class supervises facility maintenance but does include electrical system maintenance including street lights, traffic signals, water and wastewater facilities, airport, and other facilities. There is no other classification at the City that has responsibility for electrical system maintenance. We will change the match to N/C.
- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Utilities Manager, under administrative direction, organizes and supervises the maintenance and operation of the wastewater collection system, the potable water distribution system, and the reclaimed water distribution system and related facilities; inspects water main and sewer main construction and equipment for conformance with plans, specifications, City codes and laws; and maintains a budget. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera’s Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. The Water Production Manager under administrative direction, supervises and participates in the maintenance and daily operation of the City’s water production, treatment, and storage facilities; performs a variety of duties essential to daily water production from the operation of the surface water treatment plant (SWTP) and ground water wells, including planning and coordinating work, supervision, scheduling, and training of new operators, budgeting, and conformance with operating regulations. Similar to the Utilities Manager, this class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera’s Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. There is no dedicated class at the City responsible for electrical system maintenance and operations. We will not change the N/C.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Facilities Manager. The Facilities Manager plans, organizes, and directs the activities of the facilities



and property management functions including electrical maintenance through the Chief of Facilities Maintenance (responsible for the day-to-day maintenance and upkeep of the electrical and air conditioning facilities of the City, Municipal Service Center Solar Energy, and Security Camera Systems and acts as project manager for all electrical and/or air conditioning special projects). The Chief of Wastewater Facilities maintenance plans, coordinates, and directs the maintenance of the City's wastewater treatment and power generation facilities and reports to the Wastewater Manager (responsible for management of the wastewater division). In recognition of the responsibilities with electrical maintenance of utilities facilities we will add the Chief of Wastewater Facilities as a match to the Facilities Manager.

- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Building Superintendent. The Building Superintendent is responsible for planning, organizing, and setting goals for the building maintenance division. This class reports to the Director of Public Works. Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Wastewater Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match. This class supervises facility maintenance but does include electrical system maintenance including street lights, traffic signals, water and wastewater facilities, airport, and other facilities. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will change the match to N/C.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Facilities Supervisor. The Facilities Supervisor plans, assigns, supervises, and reviews the work of building maintenance personnel in the Facilities Division of the Public Works Department; and assigns and reviews the work of multiple field crews. This class supervises facility maintenance but does include electrical system maintenance including street lights, traffic signals, water and wastewater facilities, airport, and other facilities. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will change the match to N/C.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Facilities Maintenance Superintendent plans, organizes, and directs daily operations and activities related to the construction, maintenance, cleaning, and repair of City facilities, streets, utilities, and equipment; provides adequate scheduling, supplies, and equipment to assure smooth and efficient Department projects and activities; collaborates with City administrators, personnel, and outside contractors in the planning, organization, and lay out of Department projects. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera's Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will not change the match of N/C.



- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Public Works Supervisor – Facilities. The Public Works Supervisor – Facilities plans, assigns, supervises, and reviews the work of the Facilities Maintenance Division. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will change the match to N/C.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Field Services Manager plans, organizes, and direct the City's field services which may include solid waste collection and recycling, maintenance of street, sewer, storm drainage system, water production and distribution, traffic signal systems, wastewater treatment plant, environmental laboratory, and fleet operations. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera's Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will not change the match of N/C.
- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Facilities Maintenance and Airport Operations Manager, under general direction, plans, organizes, oversees, coordinates, and reviews the work of staff performing difficult and complex maintenance and building maintenance, repair, and custodial support related to all programs and activities of the Facilities Maintenance Division; administers current and long-range planning activities; manages the effective use of the appropriate City's airport, building, and facilities maintenance resources to improve organizational productivity and customer service; and provides highly complex and responsible support to the Recreation and Parks Director in areas of expertise. Electrical system maintenance related to utilities systems and facilities are managed by wastewater and/or water management that not only oversee maintenance but also operations (which is a broader scope of responsibility). We will not change the match of N/C.
- City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor. The Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor plans, organizes, and supervises the day to day maintenance and repair of streets, drains, parks, landscaped areas, playground areas, storm basins, street medians, right-of-ways, buildings and grounds; and supervises the work crews of the Streets, Parks and Trees, and Building and Grounds Maintenance Division. The Public Facilities Maintenance Manager under general direction, plans, organizes, coordinates, and directs the maintenance of City parks, streets, and government facilities; administers budget for public works maintenance activities. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera's Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. The Electrical/Mechanical Maintenance Supervisor plans, assigns, supervises, and reviews the work of the Electrical/Mechanical Maintenance staff in a wide variety of electrical/mechanical and electronic equipment associated with the



wastewater facility, water distribution system, and sewer/storm collections pumping stations, traffic signals, and street lights. This is a working supervisor position. This class requires a Grade III Certification in mechanical or electrical/instrumentation technology issued by the California Water Environment Association. The Utilities Manager plans, organizes, coordinates, and directs the maintenance and operation of water, storm, sewer collection, traffic signals, street lighting, shipping and receiving, and fleet maintenance systems; and administers budget for assigned maintenance and operations activities. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera’s Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager. In recognition of the responsibilities with electrical maintenance of utilities facilities we will add the Electrical/Mechanical Maintenance Supervisor as a match to the Public Facilities Supervisor.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Fresno	Facilities Manager	Facilities Manager / Chief of Wastewater Facilities Maintenance
Merced	Public Works Supervisor – Facilities	N/C
Turlock	Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor	Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor / Electrical/Mechanical Maintenance Supervisor

- Streets and Storm Drainage Operations Manager: “The Streets and Storm Drainage Operations Manager included a comparator for the City of Turlock, Public Facilities Maintenance Manager, the job description more closely describes the duties of the Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager and yet it was not used as a comparator for that position.”

K&A Response: The Public Facilities Maintenance Manager under general direction, plans, organizes, coordinates, and directs the maintenance of City parks, streets, and government facilities; administers budget for public works maintenance activities. This class has a broader scope of responsibility compared to Madera’s Electrical and Facilities Operations Manager in that it oversees parks and streets maintenance in addition to government facilities maintenance. We did not find that the Public Facilities Maintenance Manager was an appropriate match to the Electrical and Facilities Manager. As a note, currently the City has a Parks, Streets, and Public Facilities Supervisor (Public Facilities Maintenance Supervisor) that oversees streets, assessments, parks, storm, and facilities. This class reports to the Parks, Recreation, and Public Facilities Superintendent who also oversees recreation programs. The Parks, Recreation, and Public Facilities Superintendent reports to the Public Facilities Maintenance Manager. Overall in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Public Facilities Maintenance Manager is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

4. Administrative Analyst: “Several of the comparators used for Administrative Analyst were actually entry level analysts. These positions were general bargaining unit rather than Mid-Management positions in the selected cities.”

K&A Response: The Administrative Analyst performs professional administrative, analytical and technical duties in providing staff assistance to the City Administrator’s Office or a City department; develops, implements, and administers assigned program responsibilities; and conducts research, analysis, and preparation of budgets and reports. A typical way of obtaining the required qualifications is to possess one year of experience in administrative or management analysis.

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst. The Administrative Analyst under direction, performs a wide variety of professional analytical and administrative duties in support of assigned functions, operations, programs, department, and/or division including such areas as the City’s transit system, solid waste, and recycling programs; performs duties in support of various administrative operations and activities including special projects, research studies, budget analysis, and other specialized functions; coordinates and performs a variety of contract and grant administration duties; prepares various reports to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of operations; coordinates assigned activities with other departments, divisions, outside agencies, and the general public; and provides information and assistance to the public regarding assigned programs and services. This class requires 4 years of increasingly responsible administrative, analytical, and/or budgetary experience. This is not an entry-level class. This is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.
- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Management Analyst. The Management Analyst under administrative direction, performs a variety of professional level assignments and highly complex assignments involving research, analysis, planning, evaluation, program coordination, and administrative duties. This classification is a journey level professional managerial classification that reports to the City Manager or a division or department head of one of the City’s operating departments. Typical experience would include 5 years of progressively responsible administrative experience, preferably in municipal government. This is not an entry-level class. This is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Management Analyst II. The Management Analyst II performs professional administrative and analytical duties in one or more assignment areas. Management Analyst II is the journey level class in the Management Analyst series. Incumbents perform administrative and analytical assignments in personnel, budget, labor relations, training, or general administration. This class requires 1 year of professional experience performing analytical duties in the areas of administration, management, human resources, or related field. The Management Analyst III directs the business management functions of a medium-sized or larger department. Management Analyst III is the advanced working level class in the Management Analyst series. Incumbents have ongoing, overall responsibility for business management functions in an operating department,



including personnel management, organizational analysis and development, budget development and coordination, developing and monitoring operating policies and procedures, and supervision of subordinate clerical, technical, and professional staff. The Management Analyst II is the journey-level and has the same education and experience requirements as Madera's Administrative Analyst (in addition, based on the description it did not seem that Madera's Administrative Analyst had overall responsibility for business management functions of assigned department, as well as supervision of staff). The Management Analyst II is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.

- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst. The Administrative Analyst is responsible for performing a wide variety of professional level analytical duties in support of management goals, objectives, and operations. This is the first level in a two level Administrative Analyst series. The Administrative Analyst is distinguished from the Senior Administrative Analyst, which has complete responsibility for administering programs and/or functions. Typical qualifying experience is one year of professional experience directly related to the area of assignment. The Senior Administrative Analyst is responsible for performing the most complex analyst duties in support of management goals, objectives, and operations. Typical qualifying experience is three years of progressively responsible, professional experience directly related to the area of assignment. Even though the Administrative Analyst is the first-level within the class series, the class requires the same qualifications as Madera's Administrative Analyst and performs similar duties. The main difference between the Administrative Analyst and Senior Administrative Analyst is that the latter develops and administers programs independently rather than coordinating and implementing programs. Upon further review we see that Madera's Administrative Analyst develops and administers assigned programs and so due to this similarity in level of responsibility we will change the match to the Senior Administrative Analyst.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Management Analyst. The Management Analyst performs comprehensive research, statistical and other analytical work for a City department; collaborates with management and co-workers in providing consultation services in areas of expertise. This class requires 1 year of increasingly responsible administrative and analytical experience in a public agency. There are no other levels in the class series. This is not an entry-level class. This is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst. The Administrative Analyst under the direction of a cabinet-level administrator or mid-manager, performs responsible administrative, systems, statistical, and other analyses and staff support related to department, division, or City-wide activities and functions; makes recommendations for action and assists in policy, procedure, and budget development and implementation; performs clerical and accounting duties in support of department management; and may provide lead direction to clerical support staff. This class requires 2 years of



increasingly responsible experience in administration, management, systems, operations, budgetary or similar analyses. The Senior Administrative Analyst under the direction of a Department Manager or Mid-Manager, performs responsible administrative duties, complex research, statistical analysis, and other general analysis and staff support related to department, division, or City-wide activities and functions; makes recommendations for action and assists in policy, procedure, and budget development and implementation; performs clerical and accounting duties in support of department management; and may provide lead direction to clerical support staff. This class requires four years of increasingly responsible experience in administration, management, systems, operations, budgetary, or similar analysis. The Administrative Analyst is not an entry-level class and overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match. Additionally, the years of experience are more closely aligned between the Administrative Analyst and Madera's Administrative Analyst. We will not change the match.

- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Management Analyst. The Management Analyst provides administrative assistance to the City Manager or to a designated department head, conducts special studies, and performs a variety of managerial and analytic tasks including but not limited to those related to providing public information, provides oversight of departmental technology programs and computer applications, may prepare traffic and crime analyses of departmental computerized information systems, conducts statistical analyses, and supports administration of grant programs. This class requires 2 years of extensive experience in working with municipal agencies and computerized information systems. This is not an entry-level class. This is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst II. The Administrative Analyst II under direction, performs analytical studies, complex research, and a variety of administrative projects; and oversees the information technology needs for a department. The Administrative Analyst II is responsible for performing the full range of professional level administrative analyst work. Employees may act as project manager with responsibility for segments of the Department's/Division's operation and may be assigned to act on behalf of the department/division manager. This class requires one year of administrative experience in a position specific related area. This is not an entry-level class. This is an appropriate match and so we will not change the match.
- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was Management Analyst. The Management Analyst under general supervision, provides varied administrative and analytical support to assigned departmental and/or divisional projects and programs; analyzes programmatic practices and procedures and makes recommendations for organizational, operational, policy, and procedural improvements; conducts needs analysis, feasibility studies, and program evaluations for assigned projects and programs; develops, summarizes, and maintains administrative and fiscal records; and fosters cooperative working relationships among City departments and acts as



liaison with various community, public, and regulatory agencies. This class requires 2 years increasingly responsible professional administrative and analytical experience in municipal government, including experience in budget, strategic planning, policy analysis, organizational development, and/or personnel management. The Senior Management Analyst is the advanced level class in the series responsible for planning, overseeing, and providing administrative, budgetary, grant, and work-flow support to an assigned department; analyzes departmental practices and procedures and makes recommendations for organizational, operational, policy, and procedural improvements; conducts needs analysis, feasibility studies, and program evaluation for assigned projects and programs; develops, summarizes, and maintains administrative and fiscal records; fosters cooperative working relationships among City departments and acts as liaison with various community, public, and regulatory agencies. This class requires 5 years increasingly responsible professional administrative and analytical experience in municipal government, including experience in budget, strategic planning, policy analysis, organizational development, and/or personnel management. The Management Analyst is not an entry-level class and overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match. Additionally, the years of experience are more closely aligned between the Management Analyst and Madera's Administrative Analyst. We will not change the match.

- City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst. The Administrative Analyst under the general administrative direction of the Service Area Director, is responsible to provide administrative support by performing research, statistical, and other analytical work; assisting in long range budget forecasting, preparing budgets, and to fulfill other assignments in functional areas such as computer systems, payroll systems, personnel, purchasing and audits; and may be required to represent the department in public activities, meetings and facilitate positive relationships with other service areas, agencies or organizations. This class requires 2 years of increasingly responsible technical, administrative, or analytical experience in a public agency. The Administrative Analyst, Senior coordinates the activities of specialized accounting functions such as treasury accounting; invests temporarily idle City funds to obtain maximum investment earnings; performs complex general accounting, recording, and reporting of financial transactions; and is responsible for the City payroll and provides technical staff assistance to the Department Manager. This class is specialized by performing accounting functions. The Administrative Analyst is not an entry-level class and overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Hanford	Administrative Analyst	Senior Administrative Analyst

5. Finance Services Manager: "The Financial Services Manager comparison with the City of Clovis should have been with the Assistant Finance Director not the Accounting



Supervisor.” Additional comments: City of Lodi top monthly salary for Fin Svs Mgr should be \$9,068 not \$7,966; City of Fresno top monthly salary for Asst Controller should be \$9,732 not \$9,530; City of Clovis top monthly salary for Deputy Fin Dir (the position that should be used) should be \$10,885.

K&A Response: The Financial Services Manager under direction, directs, coordinates and supervises the activities and operations of the a variety of functions within the Finance Department including budget development, general accounting, accounts payable, accounts receivable, auditing and reporting; coordinates assigned program activities with other program functions, City departments, outside agencies or organizations; and supervises accounting staff; provides professional, administrative, and technical support to the Director of Finance.

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Accounting Supervisor. The Accounting Supervisor under general supervision, plans, supervises and coordinates a variety of accounting and auditing functions; compiles and prepares reports and performs related work as required. The Deputy Finance Director, under administrative direction plans, organizes, and supervises the City’s financial management program including investment of funds, accounting, revenue administration, and purchasing. The Assistant Finance Director, under administrative direction, plans, organizes, and directs the City’s financial management program including investment of funds, accounting, and revenue administration. Both the Deputy and Assistant Finance Director have responsibility and oversight for treasury functions (investments) which we did not see as a functional responsibility in Madera’s Financial Services Manager class description (as a note, it was included in the Director’s classification description). Additionally, Clovis has multiple levels of supervision including the Accounting Supervisor, Deputy Director, and Assistant Director whereas Madera has the Financial Services Manager. The Assistant Director is not a good match in that it would be overseeing staff through a supervisor and manager. Even with these differences we agree that the Accounting Supervisor is more of a working supervisor and that the Deputy Director has more of the management responsibilities reflective of Madera’s Financial Services Manager. We will change the match to Deputy Finance Director.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Assistant Controller and Principal Accountant. The Assistant Controller, under direction of the Controller (Finance Director), plans, organizes, and directs the day-to-day financial activities of the Accounting Division of the Finance Department, including general ledger, accounts payable, accounts receivable, payroll, enterprise accounting, financial reporting, and all treasury activities. The Principal Accountant under general direction, plans, organizes and directs activities within various accounting programs. The Accounting Division includes 21 staff. The Assistant Controller has responsibility and oversight for treasury functions (investments) which we did not see as a functional responsibility in Madera’s Financial Services Manager class description (as a note, it was included in the Director’s classification description). Additionally, Fresno has multiple levels of supervision including the Principal Accountant and Assistant Controller whereas Madera has the Financial Services Manager. Even with these differences we agree that the Principal Accountant is more of



a working supervisor and that the Assistant Controller has more of the management responsibilities reflective of Madera’s Financial Services Manager. We will change the match to Assistant Controller.

Please note that the reported salary for the match of the Assistant Controller and Principal Accountant was \$9,530 which was the average top step salaries of both classifications, \$12,621 and \$6,438, respectively. The \$9,732 salary you are reporting is the 2012 base pay for the individual. We report the top step (or maximum) of the salary range for the classification, not the actual incumbent’s pay.

- **City of Lodi:** The K&A recommended match was Financial Services Manager and Supervising Accountant. The Financial Services Manager is responsible for the Finance Division providing financial support services which include: accounting, cashier services, billing and tax administration, collection services, and mail processing. The Supervising Accountant, under general direction, performs complex supervisory and professional work in a variety of areas of accounting, including payroll and accounts payable; oversees the City's payroll system, including the analysis and implementation of payroll regulations and laws, and the processing of City wide payroll and preparation and maintenance of general ledger records; and assists with the preparation of financial reports. Lodi has multiple levels of supervision including the Supervising Accountant and Financial Services Manager whereas Madera has the Financial Services Manager. Even with this difference we agree that the Supervising Accountant is more of a working supervisor and that the Financial Services Manager has more of the management responsibilities reflective of Madera’s Financial Services Manager. We will change the match to Financial Services Manager.

Please note that the reported salary for the match of the Financial Services Manager and Supervising Accountant was \$7,966 which was the average top step salaries of both classifications, \$9,068.33 and \$6,864.34, respectively.

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Clovis	Accounting Supervisor	Deputy Finance Director
Fresno	Assistant Controller / Principal Accountant	Assistant Controller
Lodi	Financial Services Manager / Supervising Accountant	Financial Services Manager

As a note, we also relooked at the matches at Manteca and Turlock even though you were in agreement with both of these matches. Similar to the matches at Fresno and Porterville, both report to a Director classification and are considered management or mid-management (versus senior or executive management).

6. **Fleet Operations Manager:** “The Fleet Managers position has three comparators that are supervisor positions as well as one shop superintendent which would mean that half of the comparators used were positions below the Manager position.”



K&A Response: The Fleet Operations Manager, under general direction, performs a variety of management and administrative work in fleet operation and maintenance for the City; plans, directs, organizes, reviews and participates in the work of the equipment shop staff; develops, implements, and enforces fleet and equipment shop operations.

Generally it should be noted that organizationally many of the comparator agencies had one level of supervisory and/or management level classifications over fleet similar to Madera. Madera has the Fleet Operations Manager but there is no supervisor-level class (as compared to streets maintenance which has supervisor and manager classes). Although titles are different, we look at the whole position when doing our analysis and titles alone do not indicate whether a classification is a match or not.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Fleet Operations Manager and here is what we found:

- **City of Ceres:** The K&A recommended match was Fleet Services Supervisor. The Fleet Services Supervisor, under general direction, organizes, monitors, and supervises the equipment shop operation within the Public Works Department to perform a variety of technical tasks relative to vehicle and equipment maintenance; coordinates the acquisition and dissemination of the City's vehicle fleet; and provides technical assistance to the department director. This class reports to the Deputy Director of Public Works who directs, manages, supervises, and coordinates the activities and operations of the Public Works Department including water, wastewater, streets, parks, facilities, and fleet divisions. This class as a broader scope of responsibility and is not a good match to Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. We agree that the Fleet Services Supervisor is more of a working supervisor but there is no comparable class that has the management responsibilities reflective of Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. We will change the match to N/C.
- **City of Hanford:** The K&A recommended match was Fleet Superintendent. The City did not have a classification description available for the Fleet Superintendent but the match was verified with the Human Resources. The Fleet Superintendent reports to the Deputy Director of Public Works who is responsible for directing, planning, and coordinating operations and staff assigned to Public Works Divisions. This class as a broader scope of responsibility and is not a good match to Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. The Fleet Superintendent has overall responsibility for the fleet division and we feel that in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Fleet Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- **City of Lodi:** The K&A recommended match was Fleet Services Supervisor. The Fleet Services Supervisor supervises, reviews, and participates in the work of staff responsible for providing fleet services; and oversees a full service garage, responsible for the maintenance and repair of the City's fleet. The Fleet Services Supervisor reports to the Public Works Director (as a note the City used to have a Fleet and Facilities Manager that is no longer filled or assigned to a salary range). This class as a broader scope of responsibility



and is not a good match to Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. We agree that the Fleet Services Supervisor is more of a working supervisor but there is no comparable class that has the management responsibilities reflective of Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. We will change the match to N/C.

- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Fleet Superintendent. The Fleet Superintendent under the direction of the Public Works Deputy Director – Utility Services, organizes and directs the maintenance and repair of City vehicles and equipment; coordinates the evaluation of vehicle and equipment maintenance, servicing, and repair needs; and trains and evaluates the performance of assigned personnel. The Public Works Deputy Director – Utility Services under the direction of the Public Works Director/City Engineer, plans, organizes, controls, and directs construction, installation, maintenance, and repair operations and activities of the Water, Wastewater, Solid Waste, Streets, Building Maintenance, and Vehicle Maintenance divisions of the Public Works Department. This class as a broader scope of responsibility and is not a good match to Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. The Fleet Superintendent has overall responsibility for the fleet division and we feel that in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Fleet Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Public Works Supervisor – Fleet. The Public Works Supervisor – Fleet supervises, reviews, and participates in the work of staff responsible for fleet services; and oversees a full service garage responsible for the maintenance and repair of the City's fleet. This class reports to the Public Works Manager – Operations who plans, organizes, directs, and coordinates the activities of the facilities maintenance, fleet management, and solid waste divisions of the Public Works Department. This class as a broader scope of responsibility and is not a good match to Madera's Fleet Operations Manager. However we agree that the Fleet Services Supervisor is more of a working supervisor and that Madera's Fleet Operations Manager's management responsibilities fall somewhere between the Public Works Supervisor – Fleet and Public Works Manager – Operations. We will add the Public Works Manager – Operations as a bracketed match to the Public Works Supervisor – Fleet.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Field Services Shop Superintendent. The Field Services Shop Superintendent under general direction, plans, organizes, and administers the fleet management and services programs, involving maintenance and repair of heavy duty construction equipment, heavy duty trucks, buses, public transit vehicles, light weight trucks, sedans and miscellaneous equipment such as electronic accessory, equipment, generators, hoists, compressors, stationary and portable engines, welders, pumps, and motors. The Field Services Manager (currently vacant) under administrative direction, plans, organizes, and directs the City's field services which may include solid waste collection and recycling, maintenance of street, sewer, storm drainage system, water production and distribution, traffic signal systems, wastewater treatment plant, environmental laboratory, and fleet operations. This class as a broader scope of responsibility



and is not a good match to Madera’s Fleet Operations Manager. The Field Services Shop Superintendent has overall responsibility for the fleet division and we feel that in terms of duties, management responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of authority the Field Services Shop Superintendent is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Ceres	Fleet Services Supervisor	N/C
Lodi	Fleet Services Supervisor	N/C
Merced	Public Works Supervisor – Fleet	Public Works Supervisor – Fleet / Public Works Manager – Operations

7. Grants Classifications (Grants Administrator, Program Manager – Grants, and Grants Specialist): “Because similar positions for the Program Manager – Grants position were identified in an earlier study, it may be that the survey is only comparing job titles and not descriptions. Grant-funded activities are carried out in the cities identified, yet titles for personnel vary.”

K&A Response: When we do our analysis and make our recommended match we want at least a 70% match in terms of the whole position including factors such as:

- Definition and typical job functions;
- Distinguishing characteristics;
- Level within a class series (i.e. entry, experienced, journey, specialist, lead, etc.);
- Reporting relationship structure (for example, manages through lower-level staff)
- Education and experience requirements;
- Knowledge, abilities, and skills required to perform the work;
- The scope and complexity of the work;
- Independence of action/responsibility;
- The authority delegated to make decisions and take action;
- The responsibility for the work of others, program administration, and for budget dollars;
- Problem solving/ingenuity;
- Contacts with others (both inside and outside of the organization);
- Consequences of action and decisions; and
- Working conditions.

We do not just go by job title when we make our matches. We evaluate all of the factors above.

Since we did not find matches at the other cities, it was not because the cities do not have internal staff performing grants administration and support duties. Rather most



times these duties are one aspect of a more general classification such as Administrative or Management Analyst. We did not find that the cities had specialized and specific grants administration classifications and we did not want feel that these broader classifications appropriately reflected the level of specialization and responsibility performed by the grants classifications at Madera.

As a note, in the 2009 study the only grants classification that we used as a benchmark to collect market data was the Grants Administrator. We were only able to find one (1) appropriate match of Grants Writer from City of Fresno. This is what we found in the current study.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the grants classifications and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The Administrative Analyst coordinates grant administration activities; prepares, writes, reviews, and monitors grant applications; and monitors existing programs for compliance with regulations. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Administrative Analyst as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.
- City of Clovis: The Management Analyst under administrative direction, performs a variety of professional level assignments and highly complex assignments involving research, analysis, planning, evaluation, program coordination, and administrative duties. The classification description did not mention duties related to grants administration. The Housing Program Coordinator plans and coordinates the implementation of housing assistance and rehabilitation programs; manages the Community Development Block Grant Program; coordinates program activities with other City departments; and provides complex assistance to the director. This class performs grants administration duties related specifically to the CDBG program, as well as planning and coordinating affordable housing programs. This is a comparable match to the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. As a note, we looked at the Housing Program Manager as a possible match to the Grants Administrator. We did not feel that this was an appropriate match in that the Housing Program Manager is responsible for managing all activities related to housing and redevelopment programs which is a broader and specialized (different) focus compared to the Grants Administrator. We will add the Housing Program Coordinator as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.
- City of Fresno: The Management Analyst II performs professional administrative and analytical duties in one or more assignment areas. Management Analyst II is the journey level class in the Management Analyst series. Incumbents perform administrative and analytical assignments in personnel, budget, labor relations, training, or general administration, including determining needs and prepares funding applications for a variety of state and federal grants. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities



required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. As a note, the Management Analyst III directs the business management functions of a medium-sized or larger department. Management Analyst III is the advanced working level class in the Management Analyst series. Incumbents have ongoing, overall responsibility for business management functions in an operating department, including personnel management, organizational analysis and development, budget development and coordination, developing and monitoring operating policies and procedures, and supervision of subordinate clerical, technical, and professional staff. We did not think that the Management Analyst III was an appropriate match since we did not see that the Program Manager – Grants had overall responsibility for business management functions of assigned department, as well as supervision of staff. Finally, the Grants Writer was recommended as the match to the Grants Administrator. We will add the Management Analyst II as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.

- City of Hanford: The Administrative Analyst is responsible for performing a wide variety of professional level analytical duties in support of management goals, objectives, and operations. This is the first level in a two level Administrative Analyst series. The Administrative Analyst is distinguished from the Senior Administrative Analyst, which has complete responsibility for administering programs and/or functions. The Senior Administrative Analyst is responsible for performing the most complex analyst duties in support of management goals, objectives, and operations. Neither classification description mentioned duties related to grants administration or management. We did not find appropriate matches at Hanford for Madera's grants classifications.
- City of Lodi: The Management Analyst performs comprehensive research, statistical and other analytical work for a City department; collaborates with management and co-workers in providing consultation services in areas of expertise; and researches and prepares grant applications including monitoring existing programs for compliance with regulations. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Management Analyst as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.
- City of Manteca: The Administrative Analyst under the direction of a cabinet-level administrator or mid-manager, performs responsible administrative, systems, statistical, and other analyses and staff support related to department, division, or City-wide activities and functions including development and management of grants and contracts; makes recommendations for action and assists in policy, procedure, and budget development and implementation; performs clerical and accounting duties in support of department management; and may provide lead direction to clerical support staff. The Senior Administrative Analyst under the direction of a Department Manager or Mid-Manager, performs responsible administrative duties, complex research, statistical analysis, and other general analysis and staff support related to department, division, or City-wide activities and



functions, including researching and managing grants and contracts; makes recommendations for action and assists in policy, procedure, and budget development and implementation; performs clerical and accounting duties in support of department management; and may provide lead direction to clerical support staff. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Senior Administrative Analyst is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Senior Administrative Analyst as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.

- City of Merced: The Management Analyst provides administrative assistance to the City Manager or to a designated department head, conducts special studies, and performs a variety of managerial and analytic tasks including but not limited to those preparing grant proposals and applications, provides oversight of departmental technology programs and computer applications, may prepare traffic and crime analyses of departmental computerized information systems, conducts statistical analyses, and supports administration of grant programs. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Senior Administrative Analyst is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Senior Administrative Analyst as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.
- City of Porterville: The Administrative Analyst II under direction, performs analytical studies, complex research, and a variety of administrative projects including writing grant applications and administering grant funds; and oversees the information technology needs for a department. The Administrative Analyst II is responsible for performing the full range of professional level administrative analyst work. Employees may act as project manager with responsibility for segments of the Department's/Division's operation and may be assigned to act on behalf of the department/division manager. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Administrative Analyst II is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Administrative Analyst II as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.
- City of Tulare: The Management Analyst under general supervision, provides varied administrative and analytical support to assigned departmental and/or divisional projects and programs including grant reporting; analyzes programmatic practices and procedures and makes recommendations for organizational, operational, policy, and procedural improvements; conducts needs analysis, feasibility studies, and program evaluations for assigned projects and programs; develops, summarizes, and maintains administrative and fiscal records; and fosters cooperative working relationships among City departments and acts as liaison with various community, public, and regulatory agencies. The Senior Management Analyst is the advanced level class in the series responsible for planning, overseeing, and providing administrative,



budgetary, grant, and work-flow support to an assigned department; analyzes departmental practices and procedures and makes recommendations for organizational, operational, policy, and procedural improvements; conducts needs analysis, feasibility studies, and program evaluation for assigned projects and programs; develops, summarizes, and maintains administrative and fiscal records; fosters cooperative working relationships among City departments and acts as liaison with various community, public, and regulatory agencies. The Transit Analyst prepares and tracks grant applications for funding related to transit projects and programs. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Senior Management Analyst is an appropriate match for the Program Manager – Grants. We did not find an appropriate match for the Grants Administrator and Grants Specialist. We will add the Senior Management Analyst as a match to the Program Manager – Grants.

- City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was Administrative Analyst. The Administrative Analyst under the general administrative direction of the Service Area Director, is responsible to provide administrative support by performing research, statistical, and other analytical work, including seeking grant funding opportunities, coordinating needs assessments with affected operations staff, and preparing grant applications, as well as maintaining records of grants; assisting in long range budget forecasting, preparing budgets, and to fulfill other assignments in functional areas such as computer systems, payroll systems, personnel, purchasing and audits; and may be required to represent the department in public activities, meetings and facilitate positive relationships with other service areas, agencies or organizations. This class requires 2 years of increasingly responsible technical, administrative, or analytical experience in a public agency. The Administrative Analyst, Senior coordinates the activities of specialized accounting functions such as treasury accounting; invests temporarily idle City funds to obtain maximum investment earnings; performs complex general accounting, recording, and reporting of financial transactions; and is responsible for the City payroll and provides technical staff assistance to the Department Manager. This class is specialized by performing accounting functions. The Administrative Analyst is not an entry-level class and overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the class is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.

Summary of Changes

Program Manager – Grants

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Ceres	N/C	Administrative Analyst
Clovis	N/C	Housing Programs Coordinator
Fresno	N/C	Management Analyst II
Lodi	N/C	Management Analyst
Manteca	N/C	Senior Administrative Analyst
Merced	N/C	Management Analyst
Porterville	N/C	Administrative Analyst II

Tulare	N/C	Senior Management Analyst
Turlock	N/C	Administrative Analyst

8. Engineering Project Manager: The comparisons for my job title “Engineering Project Manager” are not correct or comparable. My position is to manage engineering projects from design through construction which does include construction management. However the position is not a construction manager position whereby a construction manager would be handed jobs that have been already designed and ready for bidding. A construction manager may not have or be required to have engineering design experience. Also the City of Fresno does have Project Managers for engineering projects, I am not sure what the comparable job/position used in the survey does.

K&A Response: The Engineering Project Manager under direction performs the more complex project management and construction management duties required by the City’s Capital Improvement Program (CIP); provides direction and administration of public projects during design and construction phases including the selection of professional consultants and the procurement of construction contracts; analyzes special conditions/circumstances which arise on the projects; prepares and processes any and all documents involving contractors and consultants; reviews and processes change orders, requests for information, requests for clarifications, pay requests, claims; and evaluates contractor bids prior to award.

We reviewed the matches recommended for the Engineering Project Manager classifications and here is what we found:

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Construction Manager. The Construction Manager plans, assigns, and supervises the work of field personnel engaged in the technical inspection and contract administration of public works construction and improvement projects; administers and monitors private construction development contracts; ensures enforcement of City improvement standards in construction projects; and assists in overall project administration. This class does not require engineering design experience. The Assistant Engineer and Associate Engineer are responsible for managing public works projects and require knowledge of engineering design. Since the Construction Manager is primarily responsible for construction inspection management rather than project management, we will remove the match. Additionally Madera has a separate engineering classification series that is comparable to Clovis’ engineering classification series. We will change the match to N/C.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Capital Development Specialist. The Capital Development Specialist, under direction, performs a variety of duties related to Capital Improvement Programs (CIP) for the City of Fresno including independently setting project schedules, implementing compliance programs, bid processes, troubleshooting project issues, and negotiate CIP transactions. Fresno does have a Project Manager classification that under direction, performs a variety of duties related to housing services, economic development, community development, redevelopment, historic



preservation and/or development, and public utilities projects and processes. The focus of this classification is not on capital improvement projects and engineering is not an emphasized knowledge, education, and/or experience area as compared to the Capital Development Specialist. Project Manager is not an appropriate match. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Capital Development Specialist is an appropriate match for the Engineering Project Manager. We will not change the match. As a final note, the Project Manager and Capital Development Specialist are in the same salary range.

- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Construction Project Manager. The Construction Project Manager under general direction, plans, organizes, and supervises work in connection with location, design, construction, inspection, and maintenance of major public works projects; administers construction contracts and coordinates projects including all phases from planning to project construction; performs related duties as required; receives general direction from the Public Works Director. It also provides technical assistance to Public Works Engineering, Facilities Services staff, and other departments; and provides direction over construction services/inspection staff and contract firms. This class requires the ability to design plans, specifications, and engineering estimates. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Construction Project Manager is an appropriate match for the Engineering Project Manager.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Capital Improvement Coordinator. The Capital Improvement Coordinator performs a variety of specialized complex administrative analysis work; prepares staff reports for City boards, commissions, and committees; coordinates a variety of programs and special projects; and performs pre-development activities for capital projects. Since the Capital Improvement Coordinator is more of administrative classification we will change the match to N/C. The professional engineering and architect classification series is responsible for project management duties.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Construction/Project Manager. The Construction/Project Manager under general direction, performs comprehensive construction management duties including contract administration of improvement projects and field personnel supervision. This class requires professional registration as a Civil Engineer or Land Surveyor. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Construction/Project Manager is an appropriate match for the Engineering Project Manager.
- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was Project Manager. The Project Manager is responsible for managing projects to an outcome within project scope and within both project budget and schedule, and for planning, organizing, reviewing, and evaluating staff assigned to the project management group and for instructing and assisting other City department staff in the management of projects. Although not exhaustive, the list of



projects types that will be managed include the following and are only illustrative: transportation system construction and improvement projects, facility construction and improvement projects, major studies projects, water system construction and improvement projects, sewer and wastewater treatment plant related construction and improvement projects and significant capital maintenance projects, and other projects having a defined scope with a specific budget requiring schedule and project-risk management. Overall in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Project Manager is an appropriate match for the Engineering Project Manager. We will not change the match.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Clovis	Construction Manager	N/C
Merced	Capital Improvement Coordinator	N/C

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Mary Anne Saey, Director of Parks and Community Services
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Director of Parks and Community Services classification. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. Parks and Community Services Director: “Comparables to Hanford are not be applicable as the director does not oversee LMZs, median islands, urban forest, capital projects and has a significantly smaller staff. He serves more like a recreation manager or at least he used to. If other dept. heads are not compared to certain cities in an attempt to get closer to apples to apples, than I recommend we peel this one off.” Additionally, the compensation reported for this position with the City of Lodi is significantly less than what is reported on transparent.gov for the position. Can you verify that all benefits for the position were appropriately included?

K&A Response: We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Parks and Community Services Director and here is what we found:

- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Parks and Recreation Director. The Parks and Recreation Director serves as the principal administrative officer for the Parks and Recreation Department; plans, directs, reviews, and manages Department activities and operations focused on providing a wide range of public services involving park maintenance/operations/management, recreational programs/activities, human services, and educational programs, and City-wide urban forestry programs; assures Department compliance with and enforcement of applicable Federal, State, and local laws, ordinances, and codes; and serves as a member of the City’s executive team. This position is responsible for developing, proposing, and implementing programs designed to provide quality parks, open space management, urban forestry, recreation-related health, eldercare, after-school educational programs, and community wide special events, while maintaining excellent customer service within the department’s service area; inspects and evaluates the adequacy of existing parks, median maintenance and grounds maintenance activities and recreation services and programs. The classification description does not mention responsibility for capital projects but does include oversight of median islands and urban forestry functions. Overall, even without the specific mention of capital projects we still feel that this class is at least a 70% match.
- City of Lodi: We reviewed the total compensation data reported on Transparent California and the State Controller’s Office. Here is a summary of what we found (reported as monthly values):

Source	Regular Pay	Other Pay (lump sum pay + other pay)	Total Benefits (defined benefit plan + deferred compensation + health insurance contribution)	Total Pay + Benefits
Transparent California	\$9,852	\$234.42	\$3,488.29	\$13,574.71
CA State Controller's Database	\$9,852	\$234.42	\$3,488.33	\$13,574.75

The data reported above is different from what we reported. First, in regards to regular pay, the above reported is the actual base pay for the individual incumbent whereas we report the top monthly (or maximum) pay for the classification. Thus we reported a top step salary of \$10,344.46 per month. The Lump Sum Pay includes the dollar amount paid to the employee for one-time cash outs (such as paid excess vacation and sick leave) and Other Pay includes the dollar amount paid to the employee for any other pay not reported as regular pay, overtime pay, or lump-sum pay (such as car allowances, meeting stipends, incentive pay, bonus pay, etc.). We do not report cash outs of vacation and sick leave in total compensation, nor do we report any of the other pay categories with the exception of auto allowance. We verified with the HR representative at the City that auto allowance is not provided to any classifications so this other pay would not be for auto allowance. These other pay categories are incumbent based benefits and are no provided to all in the classification. Finally Total Benefits includes defined benefit plan contribution, deferred compensation contribution, and health insurance contributions. We do not report the defined benefit contribution unless it is the employer paid member contribution. The reported value was 15.3% which represents the employer paid employer contribution. We did report a deferred contribution and health insurance contributions that were more than what was reported in the above sources (probably since the data above was for year 2013).

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Wendy Silva, Director of Human Resources
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Director of Human Resources classifications. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. Director of Human Resources: When looking at the agencies that were indicated not to have a comparable position, it appears Clovis and Hanford may have comparable positions that should have been included. For Clovis it would potentially be the Personnel/Risk Manager and for Hanford it would potentially be the Human Resources Manager. Can you please review these job descriptions and determine if they should be included

K&A Response: We reviewed all matches and non-matches recommended for the Human Resources Director and here is what we found:

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Personnel/Risk Manager under administrative direction, plans, organizes, assigns, supervises, and participates in the development, implementation, and administration of the City's personnel and risk management programs; performs a variety of technical tasks in personnel and risk management administration; and represents the City in employer-employee relations matters. This class reports to the General Services Director who oversees purchasing, facilities maintenance and fleet maintenance, personnel/risk management, community services, transit, and recreation functions. Upon further review, we agree that the scope and level of management responsibility for the human resources function, as well as in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Personnel/Risk Manager is an appropriate match for the Director of Human Resources. We will add the Personnel/Risk Manager as a match.
- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Human Resources Manager manages and coordinates the various components of the personnel system of the City organization, including, but not limited to: job analysis, classification, compensation analysis, recruitment and selection, employee and employer relations, labor relations, training, organizational development, workers' compensation, risk management, and employee benefits programs; administers policies and activities through the development and implementation of Citywide personnel policies, procedures, and programs; advises department heads, managers, supervisors and employees regarding various employment issues; and provides responsible and complex staff support to the City Manager and City Council. This class reports to the City Manager. Upon further review, we agree that the scope and level of management responsibility for the human resources function, as well as in



terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Human Resources Manager is an appropriate match for the Director of Human Resources. We will add the Human Resources Manager as a match.

- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Human Resources Manager is responsible for the overall administration, coordination, and evaluation of the Human Resources functions, including recruitment and selection, discipline, labor relations, benefits administration, performance evaluation, and compensation and classification; and serves as the City's labor negotiator. This class reports to the Deputy City Manager/Internal Services Director who oversees Human Resources, Budget/Revenue/Treasury, Financial Services, and Information Systems Divisions. The Human Resources Manager does not have oversight of risk management. The Deputy City Manager/Internal Services Director has direct management of this function. Since at least 50% of the Director of Human Resources duties and responsibilities are focused on risk management we do not feel that the Human Resources Manager is an appropriate match. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Director of Support Services plans, organizes, directs, and manages the Support Services function including overseeing City Clerk, Human Resources, and Risk Management functions. Upon further review, we feel that the scope and level of management responsibility for the human resources and risk management functions, as well as in terms of duties, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level of responsibility the Director of Support Services is an appropriate match for the Director of Human Resources. We will add the Director of Support Services as a match.
- All Others: For all of those not specifically addressed above, we also reviewed the appropriateness of non-matches (N/C) and matches. We felt that the recommended matches at cities of Ceres, Fresno, Manteca, and Porterville were appropriate. We also verified that the N/C at Tulare and Turlock were appropriate and added footnotes to explain why we did not find an appropriate match.

Summary of Changes

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Clovis	N/C	Human Resources Manager
Hanford	N/C	Human Resources Manager
Lodi	N/C	N/C
Merced	N/C	Director of Support Services

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Ted Uyesaka, Information Systems Manager
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager
CC: Wendy Silva
Subject: Draft Compensation Spreadsheets
Date: April 12, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Information Systems classifications. We have reviewed your feedback and below is our response.

1. Computer System Technician – Some were good but I found that we might consider comparing to the senior or level II position in the organizations where they have these job descriptions. For one case where N/C was stated, there was a comparable position.

K&A Response: Per the Computer Technician classification description, this class under supervision of a Division Manager, performs general technical support functions, including physical installation, assembly, configuration, and maintenance of the personal computer network linking all City departments; troubleshoots and upgrades computer hardware, software, personal computer networks, peripheral equipment and City-wide electronic mail systems; assesses user training needs and trains users in effective use of applications; makes recommendations regarding hardware and software acquisitions; prepares documentation and provides user assistance to City staff; and an essential element of this classification is the provision of prompt and effective problem-solving and troubleshooting to City employees through a centralized help desk when system failures or dysfunctions occur. A typical way of obtaining the required qualifications is to possess an Associate's Degree in Computer Science or a related field and two (2) years of computer systems employment in the following areas: microcomputer hardware and software installation and maintenance; user (Helpdesk) support; and large database file maintenance and user support.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Computer System Technician and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Systems Analyst. The Information Technology Analyst, performs a variety of technical duties involved in installing, maintaining, testing, and maintenance of the City's computerized information systems including for all computer workstations and peripherals, network equipment, telephone systems, and software used by City departments; responds to requests for assistance from system users and resolves operations problems; troubleshoots, analyzes and resolves complex systems, internal and internet e-mail systems, and application problems; and performs various diagnostic testing and maintenance on system hardware. The class is the full journey-level and advancement to the Senior-level is based on obtaining specific certifications (MCSE, MCSE/I, any CISCO certification or comparable certifications). These



certifications are not required of Madera's Computer Technician. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Technology Systems Analyst are comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match.

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Information Services Specialist. The Information Services Specialist performs work involving journey-level technical skills in the operation of personal systems and peripheral equipment; programs, operates, and maintains personal computers and peripherals; programs, adapts, applies, and trains others on existing hardware and software to meet the needs of the organization; and produces a wide variety of documents and work products. Incumbents in this classification perform journey-level technical work and the primary aspects of the position are characterized by the responsibility to operate, troubleshoot, and repair computer and network systems. There is no senior-level class within the series. The next level within the information services job family is the Information Technology Analyst which is responsible for the development and maintenance of the City's data processing and computer programming functions. The Information Technology Analyst is not a comparable match to Madera's Computer Technician. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Services Technician are comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Computer Systems Specialist II. The Computer Systems Specialist II under supervision, consults with various City departments and divisions or provides similar services within assigned department, to identify needs and requirements of personal computer based systems; and provides related technical support including training. The Computer Systems Specialist III, under general supervision, consults with City departments to identify needs for personal computer based systems and evaluates hardware and software requirements; provides day-to-day direction for city-wide hardware and software installations. This class is the advanced working/lead-level class and is distinguished from Computer Systems Specialist II in that the latter is the journey level class in which incumbents perform duties in accordance with established procedures and do not have responsibility for providing lead direction to others. We did not see that Madera's Computer Technician provided lead direction to other staff. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Computer Systems Specialist II are comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match.
- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The only class allocated to the Information Technology Department is the Information Technology Manager. We will not change the match.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Information Systems Specialist and Network Technician. The Information Systems Specialist, under general direction, monitors the City's computer system, including help desk, resolving system problems and errors, limited network user administration, and



providing training to end users. The Network Technician, under general supervision, performs skilled technical work in operating, maintaining, and enhancing the City's computer systems including, but not limited to, network peripherals, network and file server operating systems, and network applications. There are no senior-level class within the class series. The next level within the information services job family is the Network Administrator which is responsible for planning, developing, and administering the City's network and network operating systems. The Network Administrator is not a comparable match to Madera's Computer Technician. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Systems Specialist and Network Technician are comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match.

- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Network Technician II. The Network Technician II, under the direction of the Information Technology Manager, performs a variety of technical activities in the installation and maintenance of computer hardware, software, and networks; provides technical assistance in current technologies to users and department staff; and troubleshoots and resolves a variety of computer hardware and software issues in a networking environment. There are no senior-level class within the class series. The next level within the information services job family is the IT Systems Engineer which performs highly technical and complex work on installing, managing, and securing Local Area Networks/Wide Area Networks (LAN/WANs), Network Operating Systems (NOS), telecommunications, and databases; and acts as an advisor to Information Technology and user departments in order to maintain and integrate existing systems and develops new systems. The IT Systems Engineer is not a comparable match to Madera's Computer Technician. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Network Technician II is comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Systems Technician III. The Systems Technician III troubleshoots, analyzes, and resolves system/application related support requests including specialties such as systems, help desk, GIS, and web; assists and trains users in personal computer hardware/software; and provides systems support. The III-level is the highly qualified and diversified associate level class of the series, competent to perform a multitude of support and maintenance duties. There are no senior-level class within the class series. The next level within the information services job family is the Systems Engineer class series which manages a variety of network operating systems or LAN/WAN, telecommunications networks, and/or mid to high-end computing platforms and network operating systems; analyzes, plans, installs, evaluates, monitors, tests, and maintains systems and application software in personal computer, network, client/server, or web environments. The Systems Engineer class series is not a comparable match to Madera's Computer Technician. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Network Technician II is comparable to



Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the match. (As a note we also reviewed the Software Analyst class series. This class series is not comparable to Madera's Computer Technician in by the primarily performing application support and business process analysis.)

- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Analyst I. The Information Technology Analyst I reviews, analyzes, and evaluates the operations of client/server and desktop computer systems, network devices, and communication technologies; and provides technology support and training resources. Although this class is a I-level within the IT Analyst class series, the overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Technology Analyst I is comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. The Information Technology Analyst II, under limited supervision, reviews, analyzes, and evaluates information technology systems, manages advance client/server and desktop computer systems and network designs; manages the City's LAN/WAN/WWAN communication technologies and physical and virtual server environment; and performs advanced project analysis, technology solution research, documentation and training, and related duties as assigned by the IT Manager. The II-level is not comparable to Madera's Computer Technician and is more comparable to the Network Administrator. We will not change the match.
 - City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was N/C. There are two (2) classifications allocated to the Information Technology Division within the City' Managers' Office: Information Technology Manager and Computer System Analyst. The Computer System Analyst coordinates City-wide Information Services, to include systems development and enhancements, wide area network support, network infrastructure, local area network support, personal computer (hardware and software) support, system servers, internet/intranet communications, and related support. The Computer Systems Analyst is not a comparable match to Madera's Computer Technician. We will not change the N/C.
 - City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was N/C. Turlock has an Information Technology Technician classification that is performs responsible technical duties related to computer hardware and software customer support; provides project support for new and modified systems; and installs and configures desktop computers and related peripheral equipment. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Technology Technician is comparable to Madera's Computer Technician. When we initially collected the data, the Information Technology Technician classification was not assigned to a salary range. We will change the N/C to a match of Information Technology Technician.
2. Network Administrator – Some of the job descriptions are comparable, some include the support of the desktop and end-user environment where Tom is almost exclusively works with networks and servers. Tom's description also includes technical and



functional supervision over lower level systems and clerical staff where I did not see this in any of the other descriptions used in the comparison. Tom is also mid-management where the majority if not all of the comps were hourly. In at least one case the spreadsheet lists N/C where there actually were job descriptions in the organization that were comparable.

K&A Response: Per the Network Administrator classification description, this class under general supervision, performs responsible computer support activities including administration and maintenance of the City's network and stand-alone personal computers including analysis of network performance and needs; installation and configuration of work stations and various network components; troubleshoots, diagnoses, and remedies system and/or equipment problems, provides technical assistance and training to end users, and maintains appropriate security, licensing, and documentation. May exercise technical and functional supervision over lower level information systems and clerical staff (leads, oversees, and reviews the work of the Information Services Technician in the area of implementing new systems or purchasing software and hardware for new systems). A typical way of obtaining the required qualifications is to possess the equivalent of 2 years of directly related experience in supporting a network computer system (LAN and/or WAN) and 2 years of college with course work in computer science, information technology or a related field.

Generally, how other agencies allocate a classification to a specific employee group and/or classify FLSA status is not necessarily a deciding factor when making a match. We look at the whole position when recommending matches, including:

- Definition and typical job functions;
- Distinguishing characteristics;
- Level within a class series (i.e. entry, experienced, journey, specialist, lead, etc.);
- Reporting relationship structure (for example, manages through lower-level staff)
- Education and experience requirements;
- Knowledge, abilities, and skills required to perform the work;
- The scope and complexity of the work;
- Independence of action/responsibility;
- The authority delegated to make decisions and take action;
- The responsibility for the work of others, program administration, and for budget dollars;
- Problem solving/ingenuity;
- Contacts with others (both inside and outside of the organization);
- Consequences of action and decisions; and
- Working conditions.

It should be noted that it is not necessarily clear from the classification description that the Network Administrator provides technical and functional supervision over lower-level systems and clerical staff. There is a statement that this class may provide technical and functional supervision specifically related to implementing new systems and purchasing software and hardware.

We reviewed all of the matches recommended for the Network Administrator and here is what we found:

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Information Technology Systems Analyst is more comparable to the Computer Systems Technician even though this class also performs network and system administration duties. We did not feel that the Senior-level was a comparable match either. There are no other information technology support classifications at the City. We will not change the match.
- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The Information Technology Analyst is responsible for the development and maintenance of the City's data processing and computer programming functions. This class is not responsible for network or server administration. The Senior Information Technology Analyst Under general supervision provides a wide range of professional, technical support services to City staff in designing, installing, operating, and maintaining the City's complex information technology systems, including network administration, database administration, geographic systems administration, communications infrastructure, strategic system technical support, and desktop applications. Generally this classification has similar level and scope of responsibility for server and network administration, as well as database, telecommunications, and systems administration. This is an appropriate match to Madera's Network Administrator and so we will change the match from N/C to Senior Information Technology Analyst.
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Network Systems Specialist. The Network Systems Specialist, under supervision, installs, configures, monitors, and maintains the City's data networking infrastructure; analyzes and modifies overall network operations to ensure the highest level of uptime, integrity, and security. The Senior Network Systems Specialist, under general supervision, establishes, monitors and maintains integrated data networks; analyzes overall network performance to ensure effective communication between all computer platforms, distributed networks and personal computers; and provides network operating system technical support involving more complex issues. Both classifications primarily perform network administration duties and do not perform much desktop and end-user administration (these duties are performed by the Computer Systems Specialist series). Upon further review, we will change the recommended match to the Senior Network Systems Specialist since this is the advanced journey-level class and provides technical assistance in overall network performance. (As a note we looked at the Programmer/Analyst class series and this class series is much more focused on providing application and business systems support. We did not find that this was a comparable class to Madera's Network Administrator).
- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was N/C. The only class allocated to the Information Technology Department is the Information Technology Manager. We will not change the match.



- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Network Administrator. The Network Administrator is responsible for planning, developing, and administering the City's network and network operating systems. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Network Administrator is comparable to Madera's Network Administrator. We will not change the match.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was IT Systems Engineer. The IT Systems Engineer, under the direction of the Information Technology Manager, performs highly technical and complex work on installing, managing, and securing Local Area Networks/Wide Area Networks (LAN/WANs), Network Operating Systems (NOS), telecommunications, and databases; and acts as an advisor to Information Technology and user departments in order to maintain and integrate existing systems and develops new systems. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the IT Systems Engineer is comparable to Madera's Network Administrator. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Systems Engineer I. The Systems Engineer I manages a variety of network operating systems or LAN/WAN, telecommunications networks, and/or mid to high-end computing platforms and network operating systems; analyzes, plans, installs, evaluates, monitors, tests, and maintains systems and application software in personal computer, network, client/server, or web environments. The I-level is the fully qualified, professional-level class in the series and is competent to perform a variety of analytical/technical duties working with complex and highly sophisticated network operating systems, LAN/WAN projects or telecommunications projects. The II-level is the highly qualified, senior-level class performing a variety of analytical/technical duties and requiring in-depth knowledge of one or more specialty areas. Incumbents in the II-level manage complex and highly sophisticated network operating systems for LAN/WAN projects. The III-level organizes, assigns, and reviews the work of assigned personnel engaged in professional network support, operational, and maintenance duties. Based on the recent feedback provided, since Madera's Network Administrator provides technical and functional supervision to assigned staff, we will change the match to the Systems Engineer III since this is level provides similar direction of staff and performs similar responsibilities related to network administration.
- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Analyst II. The Information Technology Analyst II, under limited supervision, reviews, analyzes, and evaluates information technology systems, manages advance client/server and desktop computer systems and network designs; manages the City's LAN/WAN/WWAN communication technologies and physical and virtual server environment; and performs advanced project analysis, technology solution research, documentation and training, and related duties as assigned by the IT Manager. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the IT Analyst II is comparable to Madera's Network Administrator. We will not change the match.



- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was Computer System Analyst. The Computer System Analyst coordinates City-wide Information Services, to include systems development and enhancements, wide area network support, network infrastructure, local area network support, personal computer (hardware and software) support, system servers, internet/intranet communications, and related support. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Computer System Analyst is comparable to Madera's Network Administrator. We will not change the match.
 - City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Analyst II. The Information Technology Analyst II is responsible for performing highly technical work in the design, programming, testing, installation, planning, and maintenance of computer application systems and networks; performs research and development tasks relative to network; performs diagnoses and repairs hardware and software malfunctions; and trains employees in all proper PC computer use and basic software systems. The Senior Information Technology Analyst provides responsible, professional project management, analytical, operational support, programming, coordination, and training services in the implementation of host based and PC-based application systems for city departments; creates, designs, develops, and/or re-engineers complex and highly technical state-of-the-art information systems on a citywide basis. Generally this classification has similar level and scope of responsibility for server and network administration, as well as project management, computer programming, application support, and database administration. The Senior Information Technology Analyst is an appropriate match to Madera's Network Administrator and so we will change the match from N/C to Senior Information Technology Analyst.
3. Information Services Manager - In almost all cases the comparable positions report to a department director, assistant city manager, etc. and are considered a division under that department. Almost all are classified as mid-management positions with the City of Turlock's Information Technology Coordinator receiving overtime and callback, while Fresno's Information Services Manager reports to the Chief Information Officer and the Merced IT manager reporting to the IT Director. Also Fresno IS Managers are responsible for one division with the IS Department. Many of the job descriptions the position recommends or assists in management and leadership of the technology and systems functions.

K&A Response: Per the Information Services Manager classification description, this class under administrative direction, plans, manages, oversees, and directs the information systems activities of the City; coordinates activities with other City officials, departments, outside agencies, and organizations; provides responsible and complex staff support to the City Council and City Administrator. Receives administrative direction from the City Administrator or his designee.

- City of Ceres: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager. The Information Technology Manager under administrative



direction, directs, manages, supervises, and coordinates the activities and operations of the Information Technology Division within the Administrative Services Department including hardware, software, network, telephone, and computer systems administration; identifies, recommends, develops, implements, and supports cost-effective technology solutions for all aspects of the organization; prepares bid specifications and analyzes bid proposals for computer and network equipment and software; coordinates assigned activities with other divisions, departments, and outside agencies; and provides highly responsible and complex administrative support to the Director of Administrative Services. Even though the Information Technology Manager reports to the Director of Administrative Services, this class has management and leadership of information technology functions of the City. The Information Technology Manager at Ceres is comparable to Madera's Information Services Manager. We will not change the match.

- City of Clovis: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager and Information Technology Supervisor. The Information Technology Manager, under general supervision of the Finance Director, coordinate, develop, direct the facilitation and supervise staff in the implementation and maintenance of information systems hardware and software for the City. The Information Technology Supervisor, under general direction, plans, organizes, and supervises staff and contractors assigned to implement and maintain City-wide integrated data systems including networks and software applications operating on various platforms. Incumbents have responsibility for either Network and Communications Systems or Enterprise Software applications and database development. The reason for including the Information Technology Supervisor as a match was to acknowledge that Clovis has two-levels of supervisory classifications within the information technology job family whereas the Information Services Manager at Madera is the direct supervisor for staff (even though the Network Administrator provides technical and functional supervision this reads more as lead-level rather than a supervisor). However we understand that the Information Services Manager at Madera has management and leadership of information technology functions of the City. Thus we will remove the Information Technology Supervisor from the recommended match. The match will be the Information Technology Manager only (please note that even though this class reports to the Finance Director, we still feel that it is an appropriate match in terms of management responsibility for the information technology function).
- City of Fresno: The K&A recommended match was Information Services Manager. The Information Services Manager, under administrative direction, is responsible for planning, managing and directing information service operations of an assigned Division (either Computer Services or Systems and Applications). The Manager reports to the Chief Information Officer and supervises staff through a supervisor-level classification (Information Services Supervisor). There are approximately 53 staff within the Information Services Department with 31 staff assigned to the Computer Services Division and 12 staff assigned to the Systems Applications Division. Generally, the number of staff within the department, additional levels of supervision, and number of City staff and systems to support are much larger at Fresno compared to Madera.



Thus although the Chief Information Officer has management and leadership of the department, the scope of responsibility is much greater than that of Madera's Information Services Manager. However we acknowledge that the Chief Information Officer does have that ultimate responsibility for information services whereas the Information Services Manager has divisional responsibility and so we will add the Chief Information Officer as a bracketed match to the Information Services Manager.

- City of Hanford: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager. The Information Technology Manager, under general supervision of the Deputy City Manager, plans, develops, directs, and implements the City's information technology and telecommunications systems. In addition, this class provides technical and operational support for City departments. Although this classification does not have staff to supervise, this class has management and leadership of all information technology functions for Hanford. We will not change the match.
- City of Lodi: The K&A recommended match was Information Systems Manager. The Information Systems Manager, under general direction, develops and recommends long-term plans and strategies for effective utilization of information technology systems and the security of same systems from accidental or deliberate actions to access city data files in a malicious fashion; serves as the City's Information Security Administrator; provides highly technical and responsible staff assistance to City staff, the City Manager, and City Council in the areas of information and communication systems, management, and organization; and has overall responsibility for the City's computer-based operations including mini-computer, micro-computer, hardware and software programs, networks, and communication systems. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Systems Manager are comparable to Madera's Information Services Manager. We will not change the match.
- City of Manteca: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager. The Information Technology Manager, under the direction of the Deputy City Manager, plans, organizes, and directs the Information Technology function; establishes and evaluates technical standards for City computer and network equipment; prepares and administers the Information Technology budget; and trains and evaluates the performance of assigned personnel. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Systems Manager are comparable to Madera's Information Services Manager. We will not change the match.
- City of Merced: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager. The Information Technology Manager, under administrative direction, plans, organizes, coordinates, and manages the development and implementation of the City computer resources and management information systems and management activities. This is a specialized class with total responsibility for the technical aspects of the City's Business Applications or



Network Services resources, functions, and operations. This class reports to the Director of Information Technology. There are 11 staff within the department. Since the Director of Information Technology is responsible for the management and leadership of the department (including developing and directing the implementation of goals, objectives, policies, and procedures; and mid- to long-term plans), we will change the match to the Director of Information Technology.

- City of Porterville: The K&A recommended match was Management Information Services Manager responsible for managing the development and enhancement of computer services for the City. Although this class reports to the Director of Finance, the overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Management Information Services Manager is comparable to Madera's Information Services Manager. We will not change the match.
- City of Tulare: The K&A recommended match was Information Technology Manager. The Information Technology manager, under general direction, plans, organizes, oversees, coordinates, and reviews the work of staff performing difficult and complex professional, technical, and administrative support related to all programs and activities of the Information Technology Division; administers current and long-range planning activities; manages the effective use of the divisions' resources to improve organizational productivity and customer service. Overall the duties and responsibilities, knowledge, skills, and abilities required, and level and scope of responsibility of the Information Technology Manager is comparable to Madera's Information Services Manager. We will not change the match.
- City of Turlock: The K&A recommended match was Information Systems Coordinator. The Information Systems Coordinator, under limited direction from the Technical Services Manager, plans, directs, organizes, and supervises the Information Technology Division; assists in the development of division policies, procedures, goals: prepares division budget; interprets and applies existing policies; and represents Information Technology on issues concerning the various programs managed. The Technical Services Manager, under general supervision provides technical, financial, statistical, and other analytical support; performs research and special project management; supervises sensitive, confidential specialized record maintenance; oversees and ensures legal compliance and budgetary expenditures; supervises staff; and may fulfill other assignments in functional areas such as supervising various other administrative, accounting or technical functions. The incumbent may be required to assist in public activities or meetings, and coordinate with other service areas, agencies, committees, boards, and commissions. The Technical Services Manager has broader functional areas of responsibility compared to Madera's Information Services Manager. However we understand that the Information Systems Coordinator does not have management and leadership responsibility for the information technology functions of the City. Thus we will remove the match at Turlock and change the recommended match to N/C.

Summary of Changes

Computer Technician

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Turlock	N/C	Information Technology Technician

Network Administrator

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Clovis	N/C	Senior Information Technology Analyst
Fresno	Network Systems Specialist	Senior Network Systems Specialist
Merced	Systems Engineer I	Systems Engineer III
Turlock	Information Technology Analyst II	Senior Information Technology Analyst

Information Services Manager

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Clovis	Information Technology Manager / Information Technology Supervisor	Information Technology Manager
Fresno	Information Services Manager	Information Services Manager / Chief Information Officer
Merced	Information Technology Manager	Director of Information Technology
Turlock	Information Systems Coordinator	N/C

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

To: Wendy Silva, Director of Human Resources
 From: Alyssa Thompson, Koff & Associates
 Subject: Total Compensation Study Data
 Date: November 5, 2015

Thank you for articulating your concerns in writing regarding the compensation study as it affects the Accounting Technician II, Administrative Assistant, Assistant Planner, Maintenance Technician, Purchasing Assistant, and Water Quality Specialist II. We reviewed the feedback regarding the recommended comparable positions. Here is our response:

Accounting Technician II

Per the classification description, the Accounting Technician II performs point-of-capture data entry related to cash receipts and accounts payable transactions; prepares, processes and verifies bookkeeping entries affecting general and subsidiary ledgers; and performs customer service functions with the public and/or accounts payable vendors both in person and over the phone.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Fresno	Accounting Technician
Lodi	Finance Technician
Merced	Accounting Technician
Porterville	Accounting Technician
Turlock	Senior Account Clerk

K&A Response:

When looking at accounting support classifications, there are typically two (2) types of classifications: clerical and technical. Clerical accounting support classifications process financial transactions such as accounts receivable, accounts payable, utility billing, and customer service whereas technical accounting support classifications perform technical processes such as journal entries, general ledger adjustments and reconciliation, payroll processing, financial statement preparation, assisting with budget and audit development, and financial system database maintenance and reporting.

For agencies like Madera that only have the Accounting Technician series, we look to see where the duties of this classification lie, more within the clerical accounting area or the technical accounting area. Generally, the Accounting Technician II performs point-of-capture data entry related to cash receipts and accounts payable transactions; prepares, processes, and verifies bookkeeping entries affecting general and subsidiary ledgers; and performs customer service functions with the public and/or accounts payable vendors both in person and over the phone. In looking at the duties, most of the essential functions fall within the clerical accounting area, including accepting payments for utility services, licenses, etc.; counting cash, making changes, and balancing cash drawers, collecting

information on and creating new accounts; reviewing and processing invoices; creating and maintaining vendor files for accounts payable; reviewing and preparing vendor invoices for payment; processing purchase orders; maintain cash receipt records; etc. However, toward the end of this section there are a couple of duties that start to reflect more of the technical accounting work including preparing financial and statistical statements; preparing journal entries; and reconciling general ledger accounts and maintaining journal ledgers. However these duties are toward the end of the description and approximately 12% of the essential duties.

Thus, our understanding of the Accounting Technician II is that position performs more clerical accounting work rather than the technical accounting work. This is supported by the qualifications of the classification which requires possession of the equivalent of 2 years of experience working with cash and receipts in a customer service oriented environment or the performance of related work, and a high school diploma or equivalent.

With that said, we actually reviewed all of the matches again (not just the ones raised by OE3) to ensure the matches were appropriate.

For those where we differ on the matches, here is our reasoning:

1. City of Lodi: The recommended comparison position is Finance Technician. K&A recommended Accounting Clerk. The Finance Technician performs technical and support duties in a variety of financial applications, including processing of payroll, accounts payable, collections, and general accounting. Specifically, the Finance Technician researches and compiles complex financial information; assists in the preparation of reports, journal entries, and a variety of financial audits; reconciles financial statements; inputs, audits, and balances authorized amounts for revenues and expenses; interprets and enforces FACT Act identity theft guidelines and ensures Federal Red Flag compliancy rules are followed; serves as administrator of help desk for online payment system and researches and resolves complex online problems; enters and maintains confidential employee information; works with a variety of outside agencies; monitors and verifies wage information; and performs daily input, audit, and balancing of employee work time.

The Accounting Clerk performs responsible clerical work in all areas of finance and accounting, including, payroll, account payable, and fiscal accounting systems and provides a high level of customer service. Specifically, the Accounting Clerk performs routine finance and accounting transactions, including window receipts data entry, monthly general ledger journal entries, bank statements balancing, and generation of computer reports on payroll, revenues, expenditures, and other financial activities; prepares a variety of financial statements and costs and statistical reports; and maintains various ledgers, registers, and journals according to established account classifications.

In reviewing the classifications, the Accounting Clerk is more comparable, than the Finance Technician, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Accounting Technician II.

2. City of Fresno: The recommended comparison position is Accounting Technician. K&A recommended the Account Clerk II. The Accounting Technician performs para-professional/technical accounting work requiring the application of advanced accounting practices. Typical tasks include maintaining controlling and subsidiary accounting records; reconciling and balancing fund accounts; taking trial balances; making reconciliations to establish and maintain accounting books and records; assisting in development and verification of financial reports, statements, accounts, etc.; determining corrective entries; examining, reconciling, balancing, and adjusting accounting records; and preparing and auditing complex material.

The Account Clerk II performs a wide variety of accounting clerical work involving the processing and maintenance of financial and statistical records including preparing and processing bills and invoices; maintaining expenditure records and assigning costs to proper account or fund; maintaining journals and general ledgers; and collecting payments.

In reviewing the classifications, the Account Clerk II is more comparable, than the Accounting Technician, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Accounting Technician II.

3. City of Merced: The recommended comparison position is Accounting Technician. K&A recommended the Account Clerk II. The Accounting Technician assists finance professionals in ensuring accuracy, completeness, and timely processing in the areas of municipal finance, including but not limited to the specialized fields of Accounting, Collections, and Purchasing. Some of the duties assigned include:

- Preparing and posting entries to ledgers and journals as necessary; Reconciling accounts on routine basis; assisting with the preparation of monthly and annual financial and budgetary reports and statements; maintaining fixed asset records; preparing work papers and performing analyses in support of Annual Audit and Budget; and assisting with the audit of internal and external accounting records.
- Reviewing and recording accounts payable; issue vendor checks and encumber appropriated funds; verifying availability of funds; processing budget transfers; preparing reports in support of accounts payable operations; completing Form 1099 as required; consulting on technical matters with user departments, supervisors and the public; and preparing work papers and perform analyses in support of Annual Audit.
- Reviewing, entering, proofing payroll data and issuing paychecks and electronic payroll deposits; preparing retirement and insurance reports; reviewing and monitoring deferred compensation; submitting payroll distributions for posting; filing Federal and State wage and benefit reports, taxes and returns; preparing work papers and performing analyses in support of Annual Audit and budget.
- Preparing files and related documents on collection accounts; analyzing billing and payment data and compute balances due; initiating and representing City and its agencies in Small Claims Court actions.
- Maintaining the central purchasing system, including the preparation of various purchasing reports; updating the vendor file and qualified bidders lists as

necessary; encumbering and verifying appropriated funds; auditing payment authorizations against outstanding purchase orders.

The Account Clerk II performs a variety of account and statistical record keeping work in connection with the development, maintenance, and processing of City fiscal and statistical records; to provide customer service for utility billings and business licenses. Duties include: maintaining a variety of financial and statistical records; processing warrants, bills, and other documents involved with financial record keeping; posting information to expenditure records; verifying purchase orders; assisting with the maintenance of work and time records; receiving applications and processing business licenses; and receiving payments and processing bills for utility services.

In reviewing the classifications, the Account Clerk II is more comparable, than the Accounting Technician, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Accounting Technician II.

4. City of Porterville: The recommended comparison position is Accounting Technician. K&A recommended the Account Clerk II. The Accounting Technician performs technical and entry-level professional accounting work involving the maintenance of accounting systems including preparing and coordinating City payroll, processing purchase orders and invoices; preparing and posting journal entries; and preparing reports. The work of this classification is more technical in nature.

The Account Clerk II performs routine technical and specialized clerical accounting work involving the preparation, review, and maintenance of financial and statistical records including compiling, calculating, and reviewing accounting records; balancing, resolving, and reconciling discrepancies; preparing financial, statistical, and narrative reports or statements; and establishing customer accounts.

Per the Position Pay Plan, the City currently has five (5) Account Clerk II positions filled and no Accounting Technician positions filled.

In reviewing the classifications, the Account Clerk II is more comparable, than the Accounting Technician, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Accounting Technician II.

5. City of Turlock: The recommended comparison position is Account Clerk, Senior. K&A recommended the Account Clerk II. The Account Clerk, Senior performs advanced journey-level clerical accounting and financial record keeping activities involving the preparation, processing, and maintenance of the City's accounts payable and to prepare and maintain appropriate accounts involving posting and balancing, related general ledger work. The Account Clerk II performs responsible accounting clerical work involving the processing and maintenance of financial or statistical records in an accounting system.

Based on the additional review of the classification descriptions and documentation we feel that Turlock's Account Clerk, Senior is more comparable to Madera's Accounting Technician III in that both are the advanced journey-level in their respective class series, perform the more complex assignments, and may provide technical

supervision of assigned staff. Thus we feel that the Account Clerk II is the appropriate match to Madera's Accounting Technician II.

Administrative Assistant

Per the classification description, the Administrative Assistant performs a variety of complex, responsible, and confidential administrative duties for the Department Manager and other department management staff; maintains calendars; participates in the administration of a department; responds to and refers inquiries and complaints; prepares reports; analyzes data; may provide indirect supervision to support staff as assigned; performs special studies; serves as an office manager; and provides information regarding department policies, procedures, and functions.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Hanford	N/C
Porterville	Administrative Aide
Turlock	Administrative Assistant

K&A Response:

1. City of Hanford: The recommended comparison position is N/C. K&A recommended Administrative Support Technician. The Administrative Support Technician performs a variety of responsible and complex clerical, secretarial, and administrative duties for a Department or large division. Positions in this class perform confidential and complex secretarial administrative and clerical duties for individuals serving in management positions.

The Administrative Support Technician provides support to departments, including to individuals serving in management positions. However this classification is not responsible for office management, assisting with budget preparation, analysis, evaluation, and control; and conducts a variety of research assignments and preparing informational and financial reports.

We agree that the Administrative Support Technician is not comparable to Madera's Administrative Assistant and will remove the class as a match. As a note, we will update the Office Assistant II match for Hanford from N/C to Administrative Support Technician.

2. City of Porterville: The recommended comparison position is Administrative Aide. K&A recommended the Secretary. The Administrative Aide performs routine administrative tasks, field inspections, and difficult or complex clerical duties. The duties performed by the Administrative Aide are not focused on providing administrative support for the Department Manager and staff rather the classification performs technical, para-professional duties including researching, compiling, tabulating, and analyzing factual data; making recommendations based in interpretation of data and assisting with goal

setting for assigned projects, monitoring progress, evaluating performance against established standards, and recommending changes. This class also requires graduation from an accredited college with an Associate of Arts degree.

The Secretary provides secretarial and administrative services in support of department operations and performs a variety of complex clerical duties involving the use of tape transcription and/or stenography, typing composition, records management, organization and office management skills. The Secretary classification is primarily responsible for performing a variety of complex, responsible, and confidential administrative duties including researching, compiling, and evaluating information; arranging and scheduling appointments, meetings, and conferences; preparing a variety of correspondence, reports, and other documents; maintaining financial information; and screening calls and responding to information requests.

In reviewing the classifications, the Secretary is more comparable, than the Administrative Aide, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Administrative Assistant.

3. City of Turlock: The recommended comparison position is Administrative Assistant. K&A recommended the Secretary, Senior. The Administrative Assistant performs responsible coordination, technical, and advanced clerical support to departmental operations; provides input and technical assistance to the Service Director and Management Staff, including financial and budget administration, personnel records management, and purchasing activities; provides assistance as public/staff contact person in the Service Director's absence.

The duties performed by the Administrative Assistant are not focused on providing administrative support for the Department Manager and staff rather the classification performs technical, para-professional duties including authorizing (vs. monitoring) expenditures; participating in the forecasting of expenditures and revenues (vs. monitoring budget); coordinating the office activities of the department, determining priorities, monitoring work flow, and planning, organizing, and directing organizational administrative programs and projects; assisting in the development of department goals, objectives, policies, and priorities; and assisting in the planning for growth and future service needs and advising the Service Director and Management Staff regarding activities and needs of the department. This class also requires graduation from an accredited college with an Associate of Arts degree.

The Secretary, Senior performs a variety of highly responsible, confidential, and complex clerical, secretarial, and administrative duties for a department head including making travel arrangements, maintaining schedules, participating and assisting in the administration of the department; preparing reports; and compiling annual budget requests and recommending expenditure requests for designated accounts.

In reviewing the classifications, the Secretary, Senior is more comparable, than the Administrative Assistant, to the level of responsibility, duties, and qualifications of Madera's Administrative Assistant.

Assistant Planner

Per the classification description, the Assistant Planner performs more routine and less complex professional land use and urban planning work; assists in current and/or long range planning projects; and assists with implementation of the general plan and related issues.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Clovis	Assistant Planner

K&A Response:

1. City of Clovis: The recommended comparison position is Assistant Planner. K&A recommended N/C. K&A followed-up and spoke with the Human Resources Representative. As OE3 had found in their research, the Clovis does not have a classification description for the Assistant Planner available for review. However, the HR Representative was able to provide the following information:

- Overview of the Assistant Planner classification (based on description written in 1994): The Assistant Planner performs professional planning work, provides public information and guidance regarding planning matters, and reviews development proposals. This class works on smaller projects with short-term deadlines and repetitive assignments. The Assistant Planner requires graduation from an accredited college and one (1) year of professional planning experience.
- The Assistant Planner has not been filled since 2007.
- The City currently does not have a need for the Assistant Planner position.
- The Assistant Planner may be used in the future but for the upcoming fiscal year this position is not budgeted for and will not be used.

Even though Clovis does not have an Assistant Planner currently filled and although the class has not been filled since 2007, based on the overview of the classification, we feel that the Assistant Planner is comparable and we will add the position as a match.

Maintenance Technician

Per the classification description, the Maintenance Technician performs skilled, specialized work in the construction, maintenance, repair, and modification of municipal facilities and equipment in one or more Public Works Divisions; provides technical advice on special plumbing, mechanical, carpentry, or welding problems; demonstrates a full understanding of all applicable policies, procedures, and work methods associated with assigned duties. Performs a variety of work in the maintenance, construction alteration and repair of City Facilities and equipment such as Storm Pump Stations, Water Well sites, Bridges, Sewer Lift Stations, Storm Ponds, and various other sites. Based on additional information from the City, this classification is primarily responsible for preventative

maintenance of well sites and similar facilities which may involve facility type maintenance such as painting and mechanical maintenance like lubing. Equipment repair would be assigned to another classification or contracted out. The primary responsibility of the Maintenance Technician is not facilities or building maintenance.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Ceres	Facility Maintenance Worker II
Clovis	Building Maintenance Technician
Hanford	Maintenance Worker II
Lodi	Senior Facilities Maintenance Worker
Manteca	Building Maintenance Technician II
Merced	Building Maintenance Worker II
Tulare	Facilities Maintenance Technician

K&A Response:

1. City of Ceres: The recommended comparison position is Facility Maintenance Worker II. K&A recommended N/C. The Facility Maintenance Worker performs a variety of skilled facility maintenance and repair work on City building including plumbing, electrical systems, carpentry, painting, welding, masonry, flooring, and general repair work. This class does not perform maintenance of storm pump stations, water well sites, bridges, sewer lift stations, storm ponds, bridges, and drains and concrete construction.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches.

Madera’s Maintenance Technician is not primarily responsible for facilities and building maintenance and thus the Facility Maintenance Worker II is not a good match.

2. City of Clovis: The recommended comparison position is Building Maintenance Technician. K&A recommended N/C. The Building Maintenance Technician performs manual work involving journey-level skills in the maintenance and repair of City buildings and facilities including carpentry, plumbing, minor heating and air conditioning, electrical, painting, and other similar repair, alteration, and installation work. This class does not perform maintenance of storm pump stations, water well sites, bridges, sewer lift stations, storm ponds, bridges, and drains and concrete construction.

Madera’s Maintenance Technician is not primarily responsible for facilities and building maintenance and thus the Building Maintenance Technician is not a good match.

The Senior Maintenance Worker performs a variety of semi-skilled and unskilled duties in the repair and maintenance of City streets, sewer, water storage and distribution systems, solid waste and collection solid waste equipment, parks, buildings and related areas; checks and maintains pumps at water wells; and performs other duties.

Based on further review of the classification description, we feel that the Senior Maintenance Worker is an appropriate match to the Madera's Maintenance Technician and we will add the match.

3. City of Fresno: Although, not questioned by OE3, we looked at all of the matches and non-matches to the Maintenance Technician. K&A recommended a bracketed match of Maintenance Carpenter II, Plumber, and Combination Welder II. The Maintenance Carpenter II performs skilled and semi-skilled work in the construction, maintenance, repair, and alteration of City-owned buildings, facilities, and equipment. The Plumber performs skilled work in the installation, maintenance and repair of plumbing systems. The Combination Welder II provides journey-level work in the fabrication and repair of ferrous and nonferrous parts and equipment.

Upon further review, these classifications are not comparable to Madera's Maintenance Technician in that the latter is not primarily responsible for performing building and facilities maintenance, skilled plumbing, and welding. Thus these classes are not good matches to Madera's Maintenance Technician.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches.

4. City of Hanford: The recommended comparison position is Maintenance Worker II. K&A recommended N/C. The Maintenance Worker II performs routine, unskilled, and semi-skilled maintenance activities under the guidance of other maintenance workers. This class performs minor repairs of equipment and facilities; notifies appropriate individuals of required facility and/or equipment repairs; and may be assigned to several divisions such as streets, building, or sewer.

Based on further review of the classification description, we feel that the Maintenance Worker II is an appropriate match to the Madera's Maintenance Technician and we will add the match.

5. City of Lodi: The recommended comparison position is Senior Facilities Maintenance Worker. K&A recommended N/C. The Senior Facilities Maintenance Worker performs skilled/specialized and the most complex maintenance, construction, and repair of City buildings and facilities to include carpentry, plumbing, electrical, landscaping, heating and cooling, and repair skills related to this task; and assists staff in providing maintenance-related assistance of various projects and events designed to ensure events proceed efficiently and effectively. This class acts as a job site foreman/forewoman. Since this class is a lead level classification and primarily responsible for building and facilities maintenance, we do not think this is an appropriate match.

However, the Water/Wastewater Maintenance Worker II performs and assists in a wide variety of routine, sometimes heavy, skilled and semi-skilled manual labor in the construction, maintenance and repair of streets, maintenance, installation and repair of water, wastewater, and storm drain utility infrastructure, and related duties throughout the city. The Street Maintenance Worker II performs and assists in a wide variety of routine, sometimes heavy, skilled and semi-skilled manual labor in the construction, maintenance and repair of streets, maintenance, installation, and repair

of water, wastewater, and storm drain utility infrastructure, and related duties throughout the city; operates power-driven equipment. These classifications perform maintenance of drainage related systems (including storm pumping stations) and of water and wastewater utility infrastructure (including water wells and storage facilities, lift stations, pumps, and valves).

6. City of Manteca: The recommended comparison position is Building Maintenance Technician II. K&A recommended N/C. The Building Maintenance Technician II performs a variety of skilled duties in the construction, maintenance and repair of assigned facilities, utilities and equipment including tasks in electrical work, HVAC, carpentry, plumbing, locksmithing, and painting. This class performs welding and metal fabrication but does not perform maintenance of storm pump stations, water well sites, bridges, sewer lift stations, storm ponds, bridges, and drains and concrete construction.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches.

Madera's Maintenance Technician is not primarily responsible for facilities and building maintenance and thus the Building Maintenance Technician II is not a good match.

7. City of Merced: The recommended comparison position is Building Maintenance Worker II. K&A recommended N/C. The Building Maintenance Worker II performs a variety of skilled and semi-skilled work in the repair, maintenance, and remodeling of buildings, furnishings, and equipment. This class does not perform maintenance of storm pump stations, water well sites, bridges, sewer lift stations, storm ponds, bridges, and drains and concrete construction.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches.

Madera's Maintenance Technician has a broader scope of responsibility beyond routine, unskilled, and semi-skilled maintenance and thus the Maintenance Worker II is not a good match.

8. City of Tulare: The recommended comparison position is Facilities Maintenance Technician. K&A recommended N/C. The Facilities Maintenance Technician performs a wide variety of semi-skilled and skilled technical building maintenance, repair, and installation tasks involving carpentry, plumbing, mechanical, and electrical trades to improve, maintain, and renovate City buildings and facilities; provides complex technical support to the Facilities Maintenance Division.

Madera's Maintenance Technician is not primarily responsible for facilities and building maintenance and thus the Facilities Maintenance Technician is not a good match.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches. There are components of the Maintenance Technician's duties that are performed by other classifications such as Wastewater Maintenance Technician II and Water Utility Maintenance Worker II at Tulare; however these classifications primary responsibilities of wastewater treatment operations and water distribution operations, respectively, are not within the scope of duties performed by Madera's Maintenance Technician.

9. City of Turlock: Although, not questioned by OE3, we looked at all of the matches and non-matches to the Maintenance Technician. K&A recommended Maintenance Worker, Senior. The Maintenance Worker, Senior performs a variety of skilled and semi-skilled tasks in construction, operation, maintenance and repairs of public works and related facilities; including street maintenance, park maintenance and building and grounds maintenance and custodial duties; sign and sign painting, landscaping and streetscaping, street and storm water facilities, sidewalks, athletic facilities, swimming facilities and perform other necessary work as required to meet City needs. Incumbent also coordinates and oversees work performed by less experienced personnel as assigned. This class does not perform maintenance of storm pump stations, water well sites, bridges, sewer lift stations, storm ponds, bridges, and drains and concrete construction.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches. Since Madera's Maintenance Technician has a broader scope of responsibilities and thus the Maintenance Worker, Senior is not a good match and we will change the match to N/C.

Purchasing Assistant II

Per the classification description, the Purchasing Assistant performs a variety of general support functions in the City's Purchasing/Central Supply Division. Coordinates the daily operations of the Central Supply warehouse, including receiving and storing goods; purchasing supplies to maintain the Central Supply warehouse stock; reviewing purchase requisitions, purchase orders, standard bids and specifications, and invoices for accuracy and appropriateness; preparing and maintaining a variety of purchasing related records, files, lists, and forms; providing support for Division users of the Divisions Purchasing system; and responding to inquiries and providing information regarding purchasing activities.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Clovis	Parts Clerk
Manteca	Parts Inventory Specialist
Merced	Parts Clerk
Turlock	Parts Clerk

K&A Response:

1. City of Clovis: The recommended comparison position is Parts Clerk. K&A recommended N/C. The Parts Clerk maintains records and files relating to parts purchasing and warehousing for the City Fleet Maintenance Division; picks up and delivers parts; and performs typing and prepare periodic maintenance reports on the City's fleet using a micro-computer. The Parts Clerk is primarily responsible for maintaining an inventory of parts for the Fleet Maintenance Division, whereas Madera's Purchasing Assistant also secures and compares information regarding

price, quality, and availability, works with vendors, and researches and develops sources of supply.

Madera's Purchasing Assistant performs a broader scope of responsibility compared to the Parts Clerk.

2. City of Manteca: The recommended comparison position is Parts Inventory Specialist. K&A recommended N/C. The Parts Inventory Specialist provides coordination between the Public Works Department, Finance Department, and the Vehicle Maintenance Division on pricing, ordering, receiving, inventory, and stocking parts and supplies used to repair a variety of large and small City vehicles and equipment. Upon further review, we agree that that Parts Inventory Specialist is comparable and we will change the match.
3. City of Merced: The recommended comparison position is Parts Clerk. K&A recommended N/C. The Parts Clerk provides assistance in expediting the obtaining of needed parts and supplies and maintaining appropriate records. In looking at the current budget document, the City no longer uses the Parks Clerk classification, rather that duties are performed by the Storekeeper classification. The Storekeeper coordinates and performs the receipt, storage, loading, unloading, delivery, and inventory of supplies, equipment, and materials at the City's central warehouse facility; maintains cleanliness of warehouse facilities; and opens computerized inventory records. The Storekeeper is primarily responsible for maintaining an inventory of supplies and equipment, whereas Madera's Purchasing Assistant also secures and compares information regarding price, quality, and availability, works with vendors, and researches and develops sources of supply.

Madera's Purchasing Assistant performs a broader scope of responsibility compared to the Storekeeper.

4. City of Turlock: The recommended comparison position is Parts Clerk. K&A recommended N/C. The Parts Clerk assists in the purchasing of a variety of parts for Municipal Services including Automotive and Utilities, maintain parts room, coordinate and control inventory program, pickup and deliver parts upon request and see that all parts are charged to the proper accounts using a computerized maintenance management system. Upon further review, we agree that that Parts Clerk is comparable and we will change the match.

Water Quality Specialist II

Per the classification description, the Water Quality Specialist performs routine and complex, skilled tasks and duties assigned to classes within the Water Quality Specialist series; demonstrates a full understanding of all applicable policies, procedures and work methods associated with assigned duties in the Water division; and provides functional direction to subordinate staff. This class requires possession of a State Department of Health Services Water Treatment Operator Grade II Certificate, an American Water Works Association Backflow Prevention Device General Testers Certificate, and an American Cross-Connection Control Program Specialist Certificate. We received additional information from the City that this class is responsible for monitoring the SCADA system

and responding to alarms on the well system but does not do network administration and programming of the SCADA system.

The recommended comparison positions included:

City	OE3 Recommended Matches
Fresno	Water Systems Telemetry and Distributed Control Specialist
Lodi	Water Services Technician II
Merced	N/C

K&A Response:

1. City of Ceres: Although, not questioned by OE3, we looked at all of the matches and non-matches to the Water Quality Specialist. K&A recommended N/C. Upon further review, we feel that the Water Distribution Operator II is comparable to Madera's Water Quality Specialist. The Water Distribution Operator II performs skilled maintenance, repair, and construction work on the potable water treatment and distribution system of the Water Utilities Services Division; operates maintenance and construction tools and equipment; performs a variety of maintenance tasks relative to water distribution and treatment. This class also operates and maintains wells and reservoirs, as well as installing and inspecting backflow devices.

We added the Water Distribution Operator II as a match.

2. City of Clovis: Although, not questioned by OE3, we looked at all of the matches and non-matches to the Water Quality Specialist. K&A recommended N/C. Upon further review, we feel that the Assistant Water Systems Technician is an appropriate match. The Assistant Water Systems Technician operates and monitors water well, treatment, storage and distribution system; makes site inspections for backflow requirements; and other water quality related duties. We added the Assistant Water Systems Technician as a match.
3. City of Fresno: The recommended comparison position is Water Systems Telemetry & Distributed Control Specialist. K&A recommended Cross Connection Control Technician. The Water Systems Telemetry & Distributed Control Specialist maintains the journey level class in the Water Systems Telemetry and Distributed Control series assigned to either the Water or Wastewater Divisions of the Department of Public Utilities. Incumbents are responsible for the administration, maintenance, and operation of computerized distributed control, telemetry, and other computerized network systems including employing various computer programming languages, maintain software and developing programs to generate reports, programming water/wastewater data systems, maintaining databases for treatment and process control systems, and performing LAN administration for the division. Madera's Water Quality Specialist II primary responsibilities are not operate computerized control, telemetry, and network systems; rather the primary responsibilities are ensuring water system quality assurance by inspecting, servicing, and repairing backflow, cross-connection, and water delivery controls.

However the Water System Operator II provides lead direction and participates in the testing, cleaning, maintenance, inspection, repair, installation, replacement, surface and groundwater treatment, construction and operation of the City's water system. This class requires T2 Water Treatment Operator and D2 Water Distribution Operator certificates.

Fresno's Cross Connection Control Specialist inspects, tests, repairs, and maintains service records on backflow assemblies and conduct surveys of public and private facilities for cross connection. This class does not require the Water Distribution Operator certificate but does require the other certifications.

Based on the additional review, we feel that that the Cross Connection Control Specialist, in combination with the Water System Operator II, is comparable to Madera's Water Quality Specialist II and so we will change the match.

4. City of Lodi: The recommended comparison position is Water Services Technician II. K&A recommended N/C. The Water Services Technician II performs sub-professional engineering and water and wastewater systems planning and support activities of water and wastewater and related projects. Assumes responsibility for moderately complex engineering design and construction oversight of water, and wastewater, projects. This class performs work more similar to an engineering technician classification by performing complex drafting and mapping assignments using computer-aided methods and designs and prepares plans, specifications and cost estimates for Division projects, as well as other duties. This classification does not perform water system quality assurance by inspecting, servicing, and repairing backflow, cross-connection, and water delivery controls.

There were no other classifications that we found that were comparable matches. For example, we looked at the Utility Service Operator class series. This class series was not a match in that the primarily responsibility was monitoring, controlling, and taking charge of the City's electrical and water distribution system. This class does not perform backflow and cross-connection duties.

5. City of Merced: There is no recommended comparable position. K&A recommended Water Meter/Backflow Technician. The Water Meter/Backflow Technician has primary responsibility for reading water meters, both manually and electronically; transfers information to the Finance Office; tests and repairs backflow assemblies, including reduced pressure devices; double checks valves and vacuum breakers; and maintains written records and prepares necessary reports to meet City, County, and State requirements. When assigned to Backflow, this class requires a D2, or higher, Water Distribution Operator certificate and Backflow Prevention certification. Although this position does not perform cross connection control duties and may be assigned to meter reading, the backflow duties and certifications required are comparable. We feel that this is an appropriate match.

Summary of Changes (Changes Only)

City	Original Match	Updated Match
Administrative Assistant		
Hanford	Administrative Support Technician	N/C
Maintenance Technician		
Hanford	N/C	Maintenance Worker II
Clovis	N/C	Senior Maintenance Worker
Fresno	Maintenance Carpenter II / Plumber / Combination Welder	N/C
Lodi	N/C	Water/Wastewater Maintenance Worker II / Street Maintenance Worker II
Turlock	Maintenance Worker, Senior	N/C
Office Assistant II		
Hanford	N/C	Administrative Support Technician
Purchasing Assistant		
Manteca	N/C	Parts Inventory Specialist
Turlock	N/C	Parts Clerk
Water Quality Specialist		
Ceres	N/C	Water Distribution Operator II
Clovis	N/C	Assistant Water Systems Technician
Fresno	Cross Connection Control Technician	Cross Connection Control Technician / Water System Operator II

We appreciate your time and participation in the study. Please let us know if you have any additional questions. Thank you.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Accounting Technician II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Senior Accounting Technician	\$4,509	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Principal Account Clerk	\$4,272	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Tulare	Accounting Technician II	\$4,229	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Hanford	Accounting Technician	\$3,916	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
5	City of Turlock	Account Clerk II	\$3,616	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
6	City of Lodi	Accounting Clerk	\$3,445	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Porterville	Account Clerk II	\$3,435	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Ceres	Account Clerk II	\$3,389	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
9	City of Merced	Account Clerk II	\$3,262	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
10	City of Fresno	Account Clerk II	\$3,041	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
11	City of Madera	Accounting Technician II	\$2,837	7/1/2014		
Average of Comparators			\$3,711			
% Madera Above/Below			-30.8%			
Median of Comparators			\$3,531			
% Madera Above/Below			-24.5%			
Number of Matches			10			

only class
only class
only class
account clerk primarily

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

serves in customer service role

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Administrative Assistant						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Fresno	Executive Assistant to the Department Director	\$5,133	8/25/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Administrative Assistant	\$4,894	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Manteca	Administrative Assistant III	\$4,831	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Turlock	Secretary, Senior	\$4,395	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
5	City of Ceres	Administrative Secretary	\$4,394	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Tulare	Senior Administrative Assistant	\$4,293	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Lodi	Administrative Secretary	\$4,150	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Merced	Secretary III	\$4,020	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
9	City of Madera	Administrative Assistant	\$3,551	7/1/2014		
10	City of Porterville City of Hanford	Secretary N/C	\$3,539	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
Average of Comparators			\$4,405			
% Madera Above/Below			-24.1%			
Median of Comparators			\$4,394			
% Madera Above/Below			-23.7%			
Number of Matches			9			
NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera						

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Assistant Planner						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Assistant Planner	\$5,886	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Assistant Planner	\$5,828	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Porterville	Assistant Planner	\$5,485	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Turlock	Assistant Planner	\$5,113	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
5	City of Lodi	Junior Planner / Assistant Planner ²	\$5,004	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Ceres	Assistant Planner	\$4,907	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Hanford	Assistant Planner	\$4,840	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
8	City of Madera	Assistant Planner	\$4,719	7/1/2014		
9	City of Merced	Assistant Planner	\$4,373	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
10	City of Fresno	Planner I	\$4,341	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
	City of Tulare	N/C ¹				
Average of Comparators			\$5,086			
% Madera Above/Below			-7.8%			
Median of Comparators			\$5,004			
% Madera Above/Below			-6.0%			
Number of Matches			9			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

1- Assistant Planner is a vacant classification that is not used or assigned to a salary range.

2- City of Madera's class is bracketed by two or more comparators.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Maintenance Technician						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Clovis	Senior Maintenance Worker	\$4,933	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
2	City of Porterville	Field Services Worker III ³	\$4,068	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Lodi	Water/Wastewater Maintenance Worker II / Street Maintenance Worker II ^{1,2}	\$3,996	3/21/2012	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Hanford	Maintenance Worker II	\$3,625	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
5	City of Madera	Maintenance Technician	\$3,345	7/1/2014		
	City of Ceres	N/C				
	City of Fresno	N/C				
	City of Manteca	N/C				
	City of Merced	N/C				
	City of Tulare	N/C				
	City of Turlock	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$4,156			
% Madera Above/Below			-24.2%			
Median of Comparators			\$4,032			
% Madera Above/Below			-20.5%			
Number of Matches			4			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

1- City of Madera's class is bracketed by two or more comparators.

2- Water/Wastewater Maintenance Worker II requires D1 Water Distribution Operator and Grade I Collection System Maintenance certificates.

3- D1 Water Distribution Operator certificate is not required.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Office Assistant II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Tulare	Department Assistant II	\$3,464	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Hanford	Administrative Support Technician	\$3,425	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
3	City of Clovis	Office Assistant	\$3,424	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
4	City of Turlock	Office Assistant II	\$3,396	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
5	City of Porterville	Clerical Assistant II	\$3,268	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Lodi	Administrative Clerk	\$3,120	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Ceres	Administrative Clerk II	\$3,069	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Fresno	Administrative Clerk II	\$2,815	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
9	City of Madera	Office Assistant II	\$2,555	7/1/2014		
	City of Manteca	N/C				
	City of Merced	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$3,248			
% Madera Above/Below			-27.1%			
Median of Comparators			\$3,332			
% Madera Above/Below			-30.4%			
Number of Matches			8			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Purchasing Assistant						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Parts Inventory Specialist	\$4,376	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Lodi	Senior Storekeeper	\$4,164	3/21/2012	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Turlock	Parts Clerk	\$3,796	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
4	City of Madera	Purchasing Assistant	\$3,151	7/1/2014		
	City of Ceres	N/C				
	City of Clovis	N/C				
	City of Fresno	N/C				
	City of Hanford	N/C				
	City of Merced	N/C				
	City of Porterville	N/C				
	City of Tulare	N/C ¹				
		Average of Comparators % Madera Above/Below	Insufficient Data to do Analysis Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
		Median of Comparators % Madera Above/Below	Insufficient Data to do Analysis Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
		Number of Matches	3			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

1- Purchasing/Revenue Assistant performs procurement support duties, as well as processing business license applications.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Top Monthly Salary Data
February 2015**

Water Quality Specialist II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Top Monthly Salary	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Clovis	Assistant Water Systems Technician ¹	\$5,488	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
2	City of Manteca	Water Regulatory Compliance Specialist II ³	\$4,829	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Porterville	Water Systems Specialist ¹	\$4,630	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Fresno	Cross Connection Control Technician / Water System Operator II ^{5,6}	\$4,571	7/1/2011	Unknown	Unknown
5	City of Merced	Water Meter/Backflow Technician ⁴	\$4,554	12/23/2013	7/1/2015	2%
6	City of Tulare	Water Treatment Technician ²	\$4,535	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Ceres	Water Distribution Operator II ⁷	\$3,740	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Madera	Water Quality Specialist II	\$3,733	7/1/2014		
	City of Hanford	N/C				
	City of Lodi	N/C				
	City of Turlock	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$4,621			
% Madera Above/Below			-23.8%			
Median of Comparators			\$4,571			
% Madera Above/Below			-22.4%			
Number of Matches			7			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

1- Certifications are not required.

2- Water Treatment Technician requires T2 Water Treatment Operator or D3 Water Distribution Operator and Backflow Device Tester certificates.

3- Water Regulatory Compliance Specialist requires Backflow Prevention Assembly Tester, Water Conservation Specialist, and Cross-Connection Control Program Specialist certificates.

4- Water Meter/Backflow Technician requires a D2 Water Distribution Operator and Backflow Prevention certifications.

5- City of Madera's class is bracketed by two or more comparators.

6- Water System Operator II requires T2 Water Treatment Operator and D2 Water Distribution Operator certificates.

7- Water Distribution Operator II requires D2 Water Distribution Operator certificate only.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Accounting Technician II											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Accounting Technician II	Account Clerk II	Principal Account Clerk	Account Clerk II	Accounting Technician	Accounting Clerk	Senior Accounting Technician	Account Clerk II	Account Clerk II	Accounting Technician II	Account Clerk II
Top Monthly Salary	\$2,837	\$3,389	\$4,272	\$3,041	\$3,916	\$3,445	\$4,509	\$3,262	\$3,435	\$4,229	\$3,616
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$160	\$109									
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$140	\$103	\$344	\$93	\$384	\$105	\$363	\$161	\$277	\$340	\$291
12 Month Highest Salary	\$38	\$46	\$58		\$53		\$61		\$46	\$57	\$49
Social Security		\$210						\$202			
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria		\$1,518	\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980			\$867	\$824	\$1,709	\$1,561	\$1,374	\$700	\$833	\$1,573
Dental					\$73	\$83	\$136	\$144			
Vision					\$16	\$17	\$20				
EAP	\$2	\$2		\$1	\$2	\$1	\$4		\$4	\$2	\$2
Life	\$2	\$12			\$15	\$12	\$2		\$8	\$5	\$46
LTD	\$10					\$35	\$36				\$48
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance											
Deferred Compensation	\$119		\$128		\$163	\$103					\$18
Other ¹					\$117						
Benefit Cost	\$2,452	\$2,001	\$1,928	\$961	\$1,647	\$2,073	\$2,182	\$1,882	\$1,035	\$1,237	\$2,027
Total Monthly Comp.	\$5,289	\$5,390	\$6,200	\$4,002	\$5,563	\$5,519	\$6,691	\$5,144	\$4,470	\$5,465	\$5,643

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

1- City of Hanford provides "cafeteria style" benefit where employees can select to take \$ as pay, deferred compensation, or administrative time off.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Administrative Assistant											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Administrative Assistant	Administrative Secretary	Administrative Assistant	Executive Asst to the Dept Director	N/C	Administrative Secretary	Administrative Assistant III	Secretary III	Secretary	Senior Administrative Assistant	Secretary, Senior
Top Monthly Salary	\$3,551	\$4,394	\$4,894	\$5,133		\$4,150	\$4,831	\$4,020	\$3,539	\$4,293	\$4,395
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$200	\$146									
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$176	\$134	\$394	\$157		\$127	\$389	\$199	\$285	\$346	\$354
12 Month Highest Salary	\$48	\$59	\$66				\$65		\$48	\$58	\$59
Social Security		\$272						\$249			
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria		\$1,218	\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980			\$813		\$1,709	\$1,561	\$1,374	\$700	\$833	\$1,573
Dental						\$83	\$136	\$144			
Vision						\$17	\$20				
EAP	\$2	\$2		\$1		\$1	\$4		\$4	\$2	\$2
Life	\$2	\$12		\$17		\$12	\$2		\$8	\$5	\$55
LTD	\$13			\$24		\$42	\$38				\$59
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance											
Deferred Compensation	\$149		\$147	\$50		\$125					\$22
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,570	\$1,845	\$2,006	\$1,061	N/C	\$2,123	\$2,215	\$1,966	\$1,045	\$1,243	\$2,124
Total Monthly Comp.	\$6,121	\$6,239	\$6,900	\$6,194	N/C	\$6,273	\$7,046	\$5,986	\$4,584	\$5,535	\$6,519

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Assistant Planner											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Assistant Planner	Assistant Planner	Assistant Planner	Planner I	Assistant Planner	Junior Planner / Asst Planner	Assistant Planner	Assistant Planner	Assistant Planner	N/C	Assistant Planner
Top Monthly Salary	\$4,719	\$4,907	\$5,828	\$4,341	\$4,840	\$5,004	\$5,886	\$4,373	\$5,485		\$5,113
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$265	\$165									
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$234	\$150	\$469	\$132	\$474	\$153	\$474	\$216	\$442		\$412
12 Month Highest Salary	\$64	\$66	\$79		\$65		\$79		\$74		\$69
Social Security		\$304						\$271			
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria		\$1,518	\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980			\$867	\$824	\$1,709	\$1,561	\$1,374	\$700		\$1,573
Dental					\$73	\$83	\$136	\$144			
Vision					\$16	\$17	\$20				
EAP	\$2			\$1	\$2	\$1	\$4		\$4		\$2
Life	\$2	\$12			\$3	\$12	\$2		\$8		\$63
LTD	\$17					\$51	\$46				\$69
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance											
Deferred Compensation	\$198		\$175			\$150					\$26
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,763	\$2,218	\$2,121	\$1,001	\$1,458	\$2,184	\$2,322	\$2,006	\$1,227	N/C	\$2,213
Total Monthly Comp.	\$7,482	\$7,125	\$7,949	\$5,342	\$6,298	\$7,188	\$8,208	\$6,378	\$6,712	N/C	\$7,326

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Maintenance Technician											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Maintenance Technician	N/C	Senior Maintenance Worker	N/C	Maintenance Worker II	Water/WW Maint Worker II / Street Maint Worker II	N/C	N/C	Field Services Worker III	N/C	N/C
Top Monthly Salary	\$3,345		\$4,933		\$3,625	\$3,996			\$4,068		
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$188										
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$166		\$397		\$355	\$122			\$327		
12 Month Highest Salary	\$45		\$67		\$49				\$55		
Social Security											
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria			\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980				\$824	\$1,709			\$700		
Dental					\$73	\$83					
Vision					\$16	\$17					
EAP	\$2				\$2	\$1			\$4		
Life	\$2				\$3	\$12			\$8		
LTD	\$12					\$41					
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance	\$21					\$21					
Deferred Compensation	\$140		\$148			\$120					
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,557	N/C	\$2,010	N/C	\$1,322	\$2,133	N/C	N/C	\$1,094	N/C	N/C
Total Monthly Comp.	\$5,902	N/C	\$6,943	N/C	\$4,947	\$6,130	N/C	N/C	\$5,162	N/C	N/C

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Office Assistant II											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Office Assistant II	Administrative Clerk II	Office Assistant	Administrative Clerk II	Administrative Support Technician	Administrative Clerk	N/C	N/C	Clerical Assistant II	Department Assistant II	Office Assistant II
Top Monthly Salary	\$2,555	\$3,069	\$3,424	\$2,815	\$3,425	\$3,120			\$3,268	\$3,464	\$3,396
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$144	\$98									
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$126	\$94	\$276	\$86	\$336	\$95			\$263	\$279	\$273
12 Month Highest Salary	\$34	\$41	\$46		\$46				\$44	\$47	\$46
Social Security		\$190									
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria		\$1,518	\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980			\$867	\$824	\$1,722			\$700	\$833	\$1,573
Dental					\$73	\$83					
Vision					\$16	\$17					
EAP	\$2	\$2		\$1	\$2	\$1			\$4	\$2	\$2
Life	\$2	\$12			\$3	\$12			\$8	\$5	\$43
LTD	\$9					\$32					\$46
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance											
Deferred Compensation	\$107		\$103			\$94					\$17
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,406	\$1,955	\$1,823	\$954	\$1,300	\$2,064	N/C	N/C	\$1,019	\$1,165	\$2,000
Total Monthly Comp.	\$4,961	\$5,024	\$5,247	\$3,769	\$4,725	\$5,184	N/C	N/C	\$4,287	\$4,629	\$5,396

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Purchasing Assistant											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Purchasing Assistant	N/C	N/C	N/C	N/C	Senior Storekeeper	Parts Inventory Specialist	N/C	N/C	N/C	Parts Clerk
Top Monthly Salary	\$3,151					\$4,164	\$4,376				\$3,796
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$177						\$88				
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$156					\$127	\$352				\$306
12 Month Highest Salary	\$43						\$59				\$51
Social Security											
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria											
Health	\$1,980					\$1,709	\$1,535				\$1,573
Dental						\$83	\$136				
Vision						\$17	\$20				
EAP	\$2					\$1	\$4				\$2
Life	\$2					\$12	\$2				\$47
LTD	\$11					\$42	\$35				\$51
STD/SDI											
Other						\$7					
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance						\$21	\$13				
Deferred Compensation	\$132					\$125	\$131				\$19
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,504	N/C	N/C	N/C	N/C	\$2,145	\$2,374	N/C	N/C	N/C	\$2,049
Total Monthly Comp.	\$5,655	N/C	N/C	N/C	N/C	\$6,310	\$6,750	N/C	N/C	N/C	\$5,845

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Benefits Detail
February 2015**

Water Quality Specialist II											
Agency	City of Madera	City of Ceres	City of Clovis	City of Fresno	City of Hanford	City of Lodi	City of Manteca	City of Merced	City of Porterville	City of Tulare	City of Turlock
Class Title	Water Quality Specialist II	Water Distribution Operator II	Asst Water Systems Technician	Cross Connect Control Tech / Water Sys Operator II	N/C	N/C	Water Reg Comp Specialist II	Water Meter/Backflow Technician	Water Systems Specialist	Water Treatment Technician	N/C
Top Monthly Salary	\$3,733	\$3,740	\$5,488	\$4,571			\$4,829	\$4,554	\$4,630	\$4,535	
Employee Retirement											
PERS	\$210	\$122					\$97				
Enhanced PERS Formula	\$185	\$114	\$442	\$139			\$389	\$225	\$373	\$365	
12 Month Highest Salary	\$50	\$50	\$74				\$65		\$63	\$61	
Social Security		\$232						\$282			
Other											
Insurance											
Cafeteria		\$1,518	\$1,399								
Health	\$1,980			\$813			\$1,535	\$1,382	\$700	\$833	
Dental							\$136	\$142			
Vision							\$20				
EAP	\$2	\$2		\$1			\$4		\$4	\$2	
Life	\$2	\$12					\$2		\$8	\$5	
LTD	\$13						\$38				
STD/SDI											
Other											
Auto Allowance											
Uniform Allowance	\$21						\$13			\$15	
Deferred Compensation	\$157		\$165				\$145				
Other											
Benefit Cost	\$2,621	\$2,051	\$2,079	\$953	N/C	N/C	\$2,443	\$2,032	\$1,147	\$1,280	N/C
Total Monthly Comp.	\$6,354	\$5,791	\$7,567	\$5,524	N/C	N/C	\$7,272	\$6,586	\$5,777	\$5,815	N/C

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Accounting Technician II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Senior Accounting Technician	\$6,691	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Principal Account Clerk	\$6,200	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Turlock	Account Clerk II	\$5,643	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
4	City of Hanford	Accounting Technician	\$5,563	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
5	City of Lodi	Accounting Clerk	\$5,519	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Tulare	Accounting Technician II	\$5,465	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Ceres	Account Clerk II	\$5,390	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Madera	Accounting Technician II	\$5,289	7/1/2014		
9	City of Merced	Account Clerk II	\$5,144	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
10	City of Porterville	Account Clerk II	\$4,470	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
11	City of Fresno	Account Clerk II	\$4,002	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
Average of Comparators			\$5,409			
% Madera Above/Below			-2.3%			
Median of Comparators			\$5,492			
% Madera Above/Below			-3.8%			
Number of Matches			10			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Administrative Assistant						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Administrative Assistant III	\$7,046	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Administrative Assistant	\$6,900	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Turlock	Secretary, Senior	\$6,519	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
4	City of Lodi	Administrative Secretary	\$6,273	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
5	City of Ceres	Administrative Secretary	\$6,239	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Fresno	Executive Assistant to the Department Director	\$6,194	8/25/2014	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Madera	Administrative Assistant	\$6,121	7/1/2014		
8	City of Merced	Secretary III	\$5,986	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
9	City of Tulare	Senior Administrative Assistant	\$5,535	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
10	City of Porterville	Secretary	\$4,584	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
	City of Hanford	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$6,142			
% Madera Above/Below			-0.3%			
Median of Comparators			\$6,239			
% Madera Above/Below			-1.9%			
Number of Matches			9			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Assistant Planner						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Assistant Planner	\$8,208	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Clovis	Assistant Planner	\$7,949	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Madera	Assistant Planner	\$7,482	7/1/2014		
4	City of Turlock	Assistant Planner	\$7,326	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
5	City of Lodi	Junior Planner / Assistant Planner	\$7,188	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Ceres	Assistant Planner	\$7,125	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Porterville	Assistant Planner	\$6,712	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Merced	Assistant Planner	\$6,378	12/15/2008	6/22/2015	2%
9	City of Hanford	Assistant Planner	\$6,298	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
10	City of Fresno	Planner I	\$5,342	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
	City of Tulare	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$6,947			
% Madera Above/Below			7.1%			
Median of Comparators			\$7,125			
% Madera Above/Below			4.8%			
Number of Matches			9			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Maintenance Technician							
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase	
1	City of Clovis	Senior Maintenance Worker	\$6,943	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%	
2	City of Lodi	Water/Wastewater Maintenance Worker II / Street Maintenance Worker II	\$6,130	3/21/2012	Unknown	Unknown	
3	City of Madera	Maintenance Technician	\$5,902	7/1/2014			
4	City of Porterville	Field Services Worker III	\$5,162	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown	
5	City of Hanford	Maintenance Worker II	\$4,947	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%	
	City of Ceres	N/C					
	City of Fresno	N/C					
	City of Manteca	N/C					
	City of Merced	N/C					
	City of Tulare	N/C					
	City of Turlock	N/C					
Average of Comparators			\$5,796				
% Madera Above/Below			1.8%				
Median of Comparators			\$5,646				
% Madera Above/Below			4.3%				
Number of Matches			4				
NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera							

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Office Assistant II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Turlock	Office Assistant II	\$5,396	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
2	City of Clovis	Office Assistant	\$5,247	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
3	City of Lodi	Administrative Clerk	\$5,184	1/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
4	City of Ceres	Administrative Clerk II	\$5,024	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
5	City of Madera	Office Assistant II	\$4,961	7/1/2014		
6	City of Hanford	Administrative Support Technician	\$4,725	7/7/2014	7/1/2015	2%
7	City of Tulare	Department Assistant II	\$4,629	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Porterville	Clerical Assistant II	\$4,287	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
9	City of Fresno	Administrative Clerk II	\$3,769	8/5/2013	Unknown	Unknown
	City of Manteca	N/C				
	City of Merced	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$4,783			
% Madera Above/Below			3.6%			
Median of Comparators			\$4,875			
% Madera Above/Below			1.7%			
Number of Matches			8			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Purchasing Assistant						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Manteca	Parts Inventory Specialist	\$6,750	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Lodi	Senior Storekeeper	\$6,310	3/21/2012	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Turlock	Parts Clerk	\$5,845	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	2.11%
4	City of Madera	Purchasing Assistant	\$5,655	7/1/2014		
	City of Ceres	N/C				
	City of Clovis	N/C				
	City of Fresno	N/C				
	City of Hanford	N/C				
	City of Merced	N/C				
	City of Porterville	N/C				
	City of Tulare	N/C				
Average of Comparators			Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
% Madera Above/Below			Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
Median of Comparators			Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
% Madera Above/Below			Insufficient Data to do Analysis			
Number of Matches			3			
NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera						

N/C - Non Comparator

**Appendix II
City of Madera
Total Monthly Compensation Data
February 2015**

Water Quality Specialist II						
Rank	Comparator Agency	Class Title	Total Monthly Comp	Effective Date	Next Salary Increase	Next Percentage Increase
1	City of Ceres	Water Distribution Operator II	\$7,567	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of Manteca	Water Regulatory Compliance Specialist II	\$7,272	7/1/2014	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Merced	Water Meter/Backflow Technician	\$6,586	12/23/2013	7/1/2015	2%
4	City of Madera	Water Quality Specialist II	\$6,354	7/1/2014		
5	City of Tulare	Water Treatment Technician	\$5,815	7/12/2014	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Porterville	Water Systems Specialist	\$5,777	1/1/2015	Unknown	Unknown
7	City of Fresno	Cross Connection Control Technician / Water System Operator II	\$5,524	7/1/2011	Unknown	Unknown
8	City of Clovis	Assistant Water Systems Technician	\$5,488	7/1/2014	7/1/2015	3%
	City of Hanford	N/C				
	City of Lodi	N/C				
	City of Turlock	N/C				
Average of Comparators			\$6,290			
% Madera Above/Below			1.0%			
Median of Comparators			\$5,815			
% Madera Above/Below			8.5%			
Number of Matches			7			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Madera

N/C - Non Comparator